The Musical Quarterly Advance Access published February 13, 2008

Theorizing Race in Nineteenth-Century France: Music as Emblem of Identity

Jann Pasler

Long before the postmodern and postcolonial preoccupation with hybridization, the impact of migrations and urban expansion, as well as the notion of Western culture as a product of the colonized and the colonizers, related concerns permeated notions of race and national identity in nineteenth-century France. Within French debates about race lay a deep-seated anxiety about the racialized Self as much as the racialized Other. While the French have wanted to believe in the Revolutionary notion of the Republic as "one and indivisible,"[1] they have had to come to grips with a history characterized not by homogeneous coherence, but by invasions, conflict, and accommodation. Celts, Gauls, Romans, Franks, Southerners, and Northerners, the people and the nobility, colonized peoples and *émigrés*, each of these has formed part of the fabric of identity developed over the centuries, and yet each is the subject of intense ongoing controversy. Some French in the nineteenth century, particularly republicans, saw these cultural collisions as nourishing, inducing progress; others, especially those nostalgic for the Ancien Régime, insisted on certain continuities as responsible for "the genius of the race." Historians struggled with the transnational nature of peoples like the Celts who, living in northern Europe and southern Germany as well as France, raised questions about the relationship between race, culture, and nation.[2] Also difficult, colonial theorists had to acknowledge that colonialism, at least theoretically, necessarily involves reciprocal influences.[3] Underlying these concerns, nineteenth-century French intellectuals sought to understand how their nation emerged from successive confrontations of Self and Other, difference and similarity, and how its hybrid people unsettled these binary oppositions over time through both resistance and assimilation.

In the context of emerging nationalism, then, race was not only an imperialist construct and a product of colonial consciousness. The French were deeply concerned with who they were vis-à-vis their European neighbors, especially Germany. With the near-impossibility

doi:10.1093/musqtl/gdn002

© The Author 2008. Published by Oxford University Press. All rights reserved.
For permissions, please e-mail: journals.permissions@oxfordjournals.org

of agreeing on any one identity and the French notion of civilization as necessarily involving flux and transformation as a result of contact with the Other,[4] race had to be able to signify more than the essentialist category defined by distinct skin color or other physical characteristics, that is, a diverse people of "mixed" blood. At home, when racial categories were used to reflect on the Self, a site of lofty ideals but fractured by the clash of ongoing class and political differences, race and racial beliefs sometimes became a signifier of class or political ideal. To the extent that race suggested something shared, it could serve as a foundation for national identity; however, because its meaning varied depending on the purpose that it served, the nation itself is revealed as an ever-contested construction. The need to understand both what was distinct in French identity as well as what differentiated the West from the non-West grew particularly compelling after the Franco-Prussian war and the Dreyfus Affair as well as the expansion of the French empire. By the fin de siècle, as many French grew anxious with plunging birthrates accompanied by growing crime, syphilis, alcoholism, and suicide, they feared impending racial degeneration and the dusk of French superiority.[5]

In this article, I deconstruct late-nineteenth-century discourse about race in France—how the French saw themselves—and suggest how music, in its ability to embody and recall the past, was understood to contribute to various racial myths embedded in French identity. Not only was this meant to counteract French pessimism and fuel French pride, it could be used to validate political positions as well as promote visions of the nation's future, even when these were mutually exclusive. To understand the complicated, contradictory, and multivalent interrelationships between music, race, and identity, we cannot focus on race, as other scholars have done, only in the dialectic with colonial Others or in the preoccupation with national identity at home, as if separate concerns.[6] Here, for the first time, I bring these debates together to show that one discussion conditions the other and that these racial notions are, in effect, interdependent. Furthermore, a careful decoding of the French term *race* as it applied to music unveils some of the complex intersections of *la patrie* and France d'Outre-Mer.

We examine, therefore, musicians' and musicologists' notions of race as signified in culture, but construed variously depending on racial beliefs. These include racial origins, hierarchies, migrations, hybridity (or what some called "mixing" or "fusion"), and purity.[7] Because it was thought to shed light on these, music reinforced a sense of connection to the world—the present to the past, the local to the global. It seemed to offer access to time before history and to place beyond the limits of geography. Many resonated with Darwin, who believed that musical sounds could “awaken in us, albeit in a vague and indeterminate way, the strongest emotions resonant of a distant age.”[8] Music thus empowered a notion of race as an imaginative projection beyond the known and the knowable, and yet like history—a construct with a purpose. This purpose, increasingly, was to document not only the distinction of French culture, but also the centrality of France within Western culture.

Race as Signifier of Culture

In nineteenth-century France, as Paul Broca explains it, race had two different meanings, the first particular, the second general. Whether it designated “individuals sufficiently resembling one another that . . . they have descended from common parents” or “the *ensemble* of all such individuals who . . . have to each other a greater morphological affinity than they have with the rest of mankind” (e.g., the determination of the individual by the group), race refers to a basic “family likeness” linked to skin color. Yet when it comes to actual races, he notes, “there is no race which can pretend to personify within itself the type to which it belongs.” “Human types, like all other types, are merely abstractions. . . . There is in the human mind a tendency to personify abstractions.” The notion of human types helped facilitate comparison, simplify partial description, and establish relative affinities or differences.[9] But, given the complexity of humanity, physical characteristics were never enough, especially when it came to the desire for hierarchies. So, for race to function as a way to determine “just how far the realm of identity extends and where the realm of difference begins,” as Todorov puts it, race needed to signal far more than blood.[10] Building on the eighteenth-century theorist Buffon, who related skin color to ways of life, food, and climate, in the nineteenth-century, race came to be associated with what Gobineau called “blood, beliefs, habits, and language” and Broca “manners, language, history, and origin.” From this comes the association of physical characteristics with cultural predispositions, including morals, behaviors, and notions of beauty—the intersection of aesthetics with ethics.[11]

Race, then, could refer to both the three (or five) principal human groups defined by skin color, as well as the various subgroups. Gobineau devoted particular attention to what he thought made the white race superior. He argued that the ten great civilizations derived from the initiative of the white race or contact with it. White people shared energy, intelligence, a notion of the useful “in a larger, more elevated, more courageous, more ideal sense” than in Asian countries, perseverance, an instinct for order, a pronounced taste for freedom, hostility toward despotism, and belief in honor and civilization.[12] From his perspective, human behavior is determined by race and cannot be affected by education or environment. When speaking of race, Gobineau often uses blood, as in "the blood of the white races," as the carrier of heredity responsible for the cultural as well as physical characteristics of a race. But when discussing, for example, the Celts and the Greeks, who, even if they are both white, share neither "social culture, religion, nor blood," races can also be associated with "nations."[13]

At the same time as scientists were conducting anthropometric studies on natives from around the world, seeking scientific evidence for biological definitions of race, the notion of race as signifying culture (and not necessarily nation) became increasingly important, especially in the wake of the Franco-Prussian war. When Ernest Renan referred to the nation, he referred to it as having a "soul" like an individual, and the result of desires, instincts, suffering, and joys that a people might share "in spite of the diversity of race and language."[14] The example of Alsace, where the people spoke German but most wished to be part of France, meant that an alliance of races in the nation in France was not about coercive identity, as with the slaves in the United States, but rather a voluntary one, more like what we today call nationality. And yet race also connoted, generally speaking, what one could reasonably essentialize about a people, including what they as a group endured over time as a constitutive force. Both Renan and Taine saw as distinctive of the French race an aptitude for philosophy and science, a love of the beautiful and the sublime, and a capacity for political and military organization. Gustave Le Bon popularized the idea that the soul of a race is reflected in its beliefs and traditions—"the inheritance of all its ancestors"—and that the arts manifest the soul of a civilization, which, as a polygenist, he construed as fixed.[15] In contrast, for the sociologist Gabriel Tarde, race was the collective consciousness of a people, dependent on their memory of the past, but the "daughter and not the mother of its acquired characteristics." Disciples of Frédéric Le Play likewise saw race as "not a cause, but a consequence": "the roads that the peoples have followed" created the diversity of peoples.[16] In the nineteenth century, the term *race* circulated in several discourses, not just in biology or anthropology.

Such ideas informed a wide range of musical practices. When I recently asked a French scholar how he would translate "un musicien de la grande race," as Saint-Saëns was described, he proposed "a musician truly worthy of the name," or "a musician of the highest order." Until the early twentieth century, the word *race* could stand as a signifier of a people or a nation, even a means of classification, but not necessarily one that referred to visual and measurable physical characteristics. Race might connote a connection to one's ancestors, but not necessarily through blood, skin, and hair color. It might be something to protect, something that engenders self-esteem. To the extent that "la grande race" refers to the French race—as if that were a unified, coherent notion—it suggests the existence of national characteristics in French music.

This notion of race indeed was what the French felt differentiated them as a nation, but they struggled with what constituted their "distinguishing features." Artistic practices contributed to defining these, in part because the instincts of a race were thought to affect the artistic progress of a nation.[17] But what constituted national style, of course, depended on how they were interpreted and the purposes to which they were put. Class played an important role. Members of the social and political elite in the Union Centrale des Arts Décoratifs in the 1880s considered elegance and grace as quintessentially French and the aristocratic French past as the best model for studying them. Debussy too, at the beginning of World War I, called for more attention to Rameau's music and its elegance, "the musical tradition of our race," to which the French had been "unfaithful for a century and a half."[18] Meanwhile, folklorists looked to old poetry and indigenous popular songs for clues about the common people, taste, and customs of earlier times. In these, they also discovered lightness, charm, and grace in naïve forms. To them, these songs suggested "moral values" of continuing relevance: "gaiety for those living in constant misery, idealism for those overcome by reality."[19] By offering models of "simplicity and clarity," they also offered composers a way to "preserve the individuality and genius of the French school."[20] Those focused on differentiating French culture from that of "certain Nordic races" pointed to vague notions of south versus north, sun versus fog, clarity versus mystery. To combat the powerful influence of Wagner's music—what Debussy called "an unacceptable formula for our race," they encouraged cultivation of "clarity, elegance, and sincerity of expression" in French music as qualities "inherent to the race."[21] Calling on the language of colonialism, Alfred Bruneau expressed the view of many when he wrote, "Our music must change just like the rest, provided it remains French and applies to the particular genius of our race the international conquests from which it has both the right and the duty to benefit."[22]

Advocates of "racial qualities" often saw in them regenerative powers. In recalling the past, French artists sought not only to reinscribe their commonality with their ancestors (the definition of which depended on one's political and social allegiances), but also to renew their art.[23] In the decorative arts, the focus on elegance and grace led to a rococo linear style inspired by eighteenth-century French idioms, in opposition to Romantic or impressionist orientations. Composers from Saint-Saëns and d'Indy to Debussy and Ravel incorporated folksongs both as indexical signs to their regions of origin and as sources of naïve simplicity and grace. As one writer put it just before the opening of the 1889 Exhibition, "In the arts as in nature, when one arrives at a period of exhaustion, one feels the need to turn back to primitive things which carry regenerative virtues that neither talent nor work can replace. The artist finds in the primitive conceptions of human intelligence great poetic forces, naiveté and simplicity." With a term otherwise used to describe colonialist appropriations, he exhorts, "Let's turn back to the past and see if, in old music, we will not find elements susceptible of being developed, *débarbarisés*, rendered worthy of the majestic edifice called modern music."[24]

Racial Hierarchies

If stereotypical racial thinking could be understood as empowering a shared cultural identity within France, one that French artists could use to promote their distinction in the world of ever-growing international competition, it was also employed to promote a hierarchy of cultures, important to any nation claiming superiority. At the heart of the matter was the question of whether people come from the same species or have multiple origins. Most polygenists, such as Broca and Gobineau, believed in a separate origin for each human race, and thought that variations between human populations reflect racial characteristics.[25] Monarchists were attracted to these ideas because they seemed to validate historic aristocratic privileges, refuting the idea that man is everywhere equal. Monogenists, in contrast, believed that all human groups came from the same race and, as Rousseau proposed, were perfectible. Underlying this idealism was faith in universals and the desire to understand universal traits throughout the globe. Like Darwin, monogenists did not see a fundamental difference between a species and its variants, the *genus homo* and its various incarnations. They saw racial diversity as a result of migration and adaptation to shifting circumstances. Many were republicans who ardently believed in the potential of the environment to influence people and the ability of people, through education and reason, to adapt and change. Whereas some polygenists bemoaned racial mixing as a harbinger of racial degeneration, monogenists considered racial change and transformation as inevitable and a potential source of strength.

As much as polygenists and monogenists may have differed over racial origins, they agreed on the presence of racial hierarchies—"great" and "inferior" races, some of which may have disappeared, leaving little trace, or lost their force over time.[26] Even monogenists tended to undervalue cultures that remained static and individuals who resisted assimilation. When the discourse turned beyond France, at stake in these hierarchies was the expansion of the French empire. Prime Minister Jules Ferry saw it as his government's duty and responsibility to civilize "inferior races" as a way to maintain his country's status as a great nation. Like Paul Leroy-Beaulieu, he believed that "the people who colonize the most are the leading people; if they aren't today, they will be tomorrow."[27] Science could make arguments supporting colonial expansion, but never resolve them. Music in some ways was particularly powerful for its suggestive, indeterminate nature. For example, the languid qualities of Arab music, associated with nomadic Arabs, may have evoked to French listeners the charm of a race that some French anthropologists felt had "run its course" and, compared with European civilization, was "moribund."[28] Such notions were used to justify not only a French presence in North Africa, but also, as I discuss below, a future "fusion of the races" there.

Although Renan saw history alone as capable of judging which races were incomplete or defective, music too—a product of civilization and a symbolic practice—was used to support racial theories. It did this in three ways: through its relationship to language, its purported embodiment of temperament and intelligence, as well as its reinforcement of white superiority theories. Elsewhere I have discussed musical instruments as a tool for classifying people, and Matthew Head has pointed to the "anxious vigilance over categories and boundaries when dealing with alterity" as one of the "European strategies of surveillance."[29] I have also shown how the French considered their indigenous folksong (*chansons populaires*) as dialects, used them to argue for racial similarities and differences within the country, and argued through them over the nature of French identity.[30] Here I focus on what French scholars' interpretations of musical scales and instruments contributed to the discourse on race and how polygenism and monogenism shaped both their questions and their musical conclusions.

In an 1867 lecture before the Société d'Anthropologie (with Broca present), and later in his multivolume *Histoire de la musique*, the Belgian François-Joseph Fétis, highly respected in France, proposed that musical systems could shed light on racial origins and reinforce the notion of distinct races.[31] In studying ancient musical instruments and images of them on old monuments, he concentrated on the number and kind of notes that could be performed as clues to the nature of their musical scales and the relative sophistication of their culture. From the dimensions and number of strings and divisions of the octave on Egyptian harps and the Persian tanbura, he inferred that the musical scales of the Assyrians and the Egyptians were the same—thereby, agreeing with Renan, that "the origin of the Semitic race was Aryan." Although anthropologists had noted significant differences in the language and spirit of Aryan and Semitic people, Fétis suggested that perhaps music evolved among these people before they formed language.[32] From early Sanskrit manuscripts suggesting twenty-two intervals to an octave and instruments permitting twenty-four quarter tones used by Persians, Turks, Arabs, Lydians, Assyrians, Egyptians, and Greeks (in their enharmonic genre), he concluded that Aryans shared a pronounced taste for multiple small intervals. They also used the note *la* as the fundamental of their scales and divided these scales into two parts, one of quarter tones (for "enharmonic music"), the other of semitones (for "chromatic music"). Fétis interpreted this as a result of the "nervous sensibility of ancient Aryans who needed a multitude of intonations . . . and a great quantity of nuances to express the passionate movements of the soul." That contemporary Hindus had twenty-two *scrutis* and Arabs divided their tones into thirds rather than fourths he saw as "slight modifications produced over time." Music of the "yellow race," in contrast, suggested "no point of contact" in the tonality, character, or form of their music. Asians use *fa* as their fundamental, and their scales are based on five notes without any semitones.[33] Although he made no explicit value judgments in that first lecture, underlying Fétis's writing is a belief in a strict racial determinism resembling that of Gobineau, for whom "the hierarchy in languages corresponds rigorously to the hierarchy of races," a polygenist foregone conclusion.[34]

Nineteenth-century music historians espousing monogenist notions about racial origins likewise studied musical scales and instruments of various people around the world. In his extensive "ethnography," Johannes Weber, like Fétis, focused on instruments thought to be indigenous.[35] In contrast to Fétis, he found in them a kind of musical universalism, or support for monogenism, by concentrating on the diatonic notes of scales rather than their subdivisions. Taking Indian music as his primary example, and comparing the cents of ancient and modern Hindu scale tones with those of the Western scale as noted by Western acousticians, he observed that the differences are never more than a comma.[36] Chinese scales, furthermore, he described as "equivalent to our major scale" but with the "suppression of semitones."[37] Ancient Arab songs, and some modern ones, are also diatonic, but with a minor seventh.[38] To explain microtonal differences, he noted that singers sometimes sing out of tune or, in Asia, have difficulty with producing semitones and that, in the case of excessive ornamentation as in Arab music, the culture was in a period of “musical degradation.” A monogenist predisposition thus could lead to as many imaginative projections about music in conjunction with race and as much dismissive judgment as a polygenist one.

A second concern centered on the relationship between music and human intelligence or character. Just as Gobineau asserted that “the state of a language corresponds to the intellectual state of the group that speaks,” Fétis claimed that hearing music of a people makes it easy to judge their intelligence as well as their morals, passions, and other dispositions.[39] This concept arose from the polygenist notion that in every civilization, race more than milieu or anything else determines the individuality and character of the people, even if civilizations change over time. As evidence for “organs of intelligence” that seem “defective” or “less satisfying,” Fétis pointed to traditions whose music was long based on a small number of notes, in part a function of the number of notes their instruments could play. Cannibals, with “no more than three notes at their disposition,” were seen as the least musical.[40] The melodic forms of Tahitian music had very little variety because the flutes accompanying them had only two or three holes. Weber concurred that “savage” peoples tend to have very short, repetitive melodies. This, he added, could also be said of some Arab music and that of European peasants. But to Weber, more important evidence of a people’s “moral and intellectual education” was the presence of a “tonal system.” While music driven by “instinct” characterized the “savage” races, music with a tonal system (even if without any sense of harmony, such as Indian music) showed a developed capacity for reason and a sense of organization, thereby belonging to people with civilization. This would have supported related assertions about race by Renan and later Le Bon.[41] As Weber put it, “everywhere things follow a logical and uniform course: first is singing, then instruments made to imitate or repeat melodies; at a more advanced stage of civilization come rules to tune instruments, a tonal system.”[42]

Weber was interested in the relative progress of cultures. Although he heard much non-Western music as “an incoherent mixture of sounds that agreeably titillated ears without much musicality,” he searched for instances of music that went beyond monody, whether simple or complex. In Ashanti music he found intervals of a third, though he considered this very unusual.[43] Acknowledging that, at its origin, musical polyphony in the West was a “succession of intervals or combinations of sounds that today would seem ear-splitting," he recognized that "it took many years for harmony to develop." This gave him sympathy for the rudimentary musical polyphony outside the West, albeit a polyphony of timbres rather than melodies. (His notion of music as originally timbre and rhythm would have resonated with French audiences and composers, particularly Debussy.) But because most French musicians saw harmony as the most advanced musical accomplishment, inevitably musical progress got confused with race as well as culture. The absence of harmony reinforced prejudices about "inferior" races, defined in part by their lack of susceptibility to musical progress as defined in Western terms.[44] As the music historian and composer Bourgault-Ducoudray put it, harmony was the "conquest of the white race." Many agreed with Gobineau and Renan that progress, or the ability to develop progressively over time, was characteristic of the Aryan race and the result of other races' contact with it.[45]

Julien Tiersot, a musicologist and ethnographer, had a more complicated notion of the meaning of harmony in the West and related its use in France to class differences. In France "the development of harmonic music established an absolute difference between song, which remained the domain of peasants, and *la musique savante*, reserved for elevated or enlightened classes."[46] Later, critiquing the Eurocentrism expressed above, he even saw harmony as "such a need in the modern spirit" that it could be a liability, leading one to be "repelled" by any music without it.[47] When he went around taking notes on various non-Western musics at the 1889 and 1900 Exhibitions, he looked particularly for the presence of harmony. While admitting that Easterners understand harmony very differently, he compared one of the Javanese chords to a ninth as one might hear in *Tristan* and says one piece gave the impression of being in D minor throughout. However, he doubted the Javanese had "any rules concerning the combination of simultaneous sounds." In listening to music from black Africa and Oceania, he found particularly significant lessons. The simultaneous playing of two Senegalese balafons during the Exhibition, not in unison, suggested a kind of harmony; however, Tiersot concluded that the musicians were not guided by preexisting principles. These harmonies, he surmises, most likely resulted from "improvisation," "chance," or "an intuitive understanding among the two musicians," as if these would not involve conscious choices. Yet, when the Pahouin singers from the Congo, the Kanak from New Caledonia, and the Tahitians produced harmonies from their simultaneous voices, he surmised that harmony, "which we like to consider as the conquest of the modern genius," has much older traditions outside the West, has existed independently of the ancient art of Greece and Rome, and “seems to have stayed stable since its origins.”[48] Although Westerners at first were “reduced to the practice of homophonic singing, vocal harmonies probably existed in the practices of distant races for a long time.” Tiersot saw these conclusions as a “real discovery” with important implications for the history of music. Harmony, he noted, is “not the exclusive product of complex mental work, but, to the contrary, something natural to mankind, even savages or primitive people; its rights in the realm of Art are equal to those of melody.”[49] In other words, harmony was a musical universal, shared and commonly embraced by all humans—a major contribution to the theory of monogenism.

Cultural definitions of race, however, could undermine presumably fixed racial hierarchies. Indeed when it came to outside influences on a people’s culture, such as Arab influences on Persian music or French influences on Tahitian music, theorists worried about the impact of these on racial identity.[50] Music and musical practices might be means by which people recognize certain identities, but they also document how identities can be transformed, whether through migrations, invasions, or simply contact between peoples. As Broca pointed out to Fétis after his 1867 lecture, because “the ethnic connections between scales are perfectly analogous to linguistic connections,” music changes under foreign influences just as language does.[51] Some, anxious over the potential loss of connection to one’s ancestors, feared that “mixing” (with all that entailed) risked “neutralizing” the “original character” of the race.[52] Others—Orientalists, many of them—idealized intercultural contact as an opportunity to inherit the riches of the other. David Spurr calls this the “doctrine of the colonizer’s natural inheritance.”[53] The example of France gave hope to some that mixing could also result in a propitious fusion.

Migration and Racial “Mixing”

Throughout the nineteenth century, historians, race theorists, anthropologists, and ethnographers, seeking to understand the origins of the races, studied human migration around the globe: the invasions, the battles, the colonizations, the “traces” they left behind, and the impact they had on one another, particularly that of white people on others. Because the French believed that people carry their racial predispositions with them, migration implied the migration of races, not just tribes or nations.[54] Gobineau defined two types of “migration,” “voluntary” and “unexpected,” associating the former with strong people and the latter with weaker ones.[55] What interested them was not only who went where when, but also what characteristics a people maintained despite these disruptions, and which it lost.

To understand intercultural contact and the impact of migrations, some looked to music, although this was also apt to stimulate imaginative mythologies. The most extreme claim came from Gobineau, who looked askance at the common effect of migration, racial "mixture [*mélange*]," yet believed that the arts and the "artistic genius" arose from "marriage between whites and blacks." Gobineau saw Greek civilization as the result of contact between Aryan and Semitic peoples, the latter having earlier undergone contact with blacks. If whites were superior from the perspective of intelligence, they were also inferior in their sensuality and the intensity of their sensations. Mixing the two formed a race "infinitely more gifted with imagination and sensibility alongside great intelligence." From the combination of sensuality and spirituality, passion and rationality, emotion and intelligence emerged the arts. Other than Viollet-le-Duc, it is not clear that anyone ever took this seriously.[56] However, with increasing contact with the rest of the world came both self-consciousness about each people's cultural relativity and a preoccupation with racial "mixing." Some, such as Renan, saw this as the "regeneration of the inferior or degenerate races by the superior races," and this "as part of the Providential order."[57] Put another way, when in contact, the stronger races were seen as necessarily absorbing the weaker ones. Such discourse was important to colonialists who sought to extend their impact on the world. When the French first arrived in Senegal in the mid-nineteenth century, they promoted racial intermarriage as a way of assuring not only assimilation, but also stable and long-term influence on the culture.

Music historians of the period focused on the movement of music and musical instruments from one culture to another that documents these migrations. Yet this was so prevalent that they had a hard time differentiating the indigenous from the imported. And while race theorists tended to assume that when a people submits to another one, it submits to their influence, music scholars such as Weber acknowledged that the phenomenon of influence was more complex. Although Persians were considered a superior civilization when Arabs occupied Persia, Persian music showed the impact of Arab music, albeit less than did the music in Egypt and Turkey, whose people resisted the Arabs less. Moreover, at least from a French perspective, Arab influence purportedly had a negative effect in Persia, dragging the culture and its music down rather than elevating them.[58] Musical instruments were perhaps the easiest way to document intercultural contact. But the presence of similar instruments over a vast geographical area, like the balafon throughout West Africa and certain instruments in North Vietnam and China, raised the possibility of reciprocal influences. The omnipresence of instruments like the drum, harp, and flute, found in cultures from northern Europe to China and Africa, likewise defied any teleological notion of influence and seemed to support monogenist notions of universal taste.[59]

Perhaps because Tahiti became a colony in 1880, or because Polynesians were considered a race mixed from *les noirs et les jaunes*—Gobineau called them "*races tertiaires*," or "*races quartenaires*"[60]—Fétis, Weber, and Tiersot each address changes in Tahitian music after the arrival of Europeans. However, a skeptical anthropologist after Fétis's lecture pointed out that contemporary Tahitians perform "the same music as us and take the greatest pleasure in our orchestral music." This led him to conclude that "one should not judge the musical aptitude of a people by the notes of their scale."[61] Indeed, with the presumption of French superiority dominating these inquiries, and publications full of unsubstantiated claims, the notion of race, whether polygenist or monogenist, had limited usefulness in explaining musical differences beyond the West.

Back in France, although folksong collectors searched among the country's *chansons populaires* for melodic "types," Tiersot concluded that melodies too are "essentially mobile, fluid, malleable, infinitely delicate, and susceptible to be transformed under the most diverse influences."[62] This supported monogenist beliefs about the human race. As with human types, musical types are an abstraction, their absolute fixity a fiction. Even within one country, people adapt them to different dialects and accents from one region to another. Tiersot found numerous examples of songs popular in one region that originated in another one, sometimes taking on a new character. "Transformation, metamorphosis," he concluded, is the rule rather than the exception.[63] Calling on the mechanism of racial transformation in analyzing the effects of regional differences on musical production, Tiersot explained song variants as the results of "musical acclimatization." To acclimatize an individual or race of whatever species meant to remove it from its place of origin and imprint on its organization modifications that rendered it able to exist and perpetuate its species under these new conditions.[64]

In his *Notes d'ethnographie musicale*, Tiersot goes further, giving an example that suggests how migrating people and music can complicate the notion of influence and any assumption of indigenous authenticity. At the 1900 Universal Exhibition in Paris, he encountered an Arab musician playing a tune that resembled a bourrée from the center of France. Nearby, Tiersot heard a group of musicians from that part of the country who, all day long during the Exhibition, played their regional repertoire. Tiersot deduced that the Arab must have borrowed from what he had just heard. "But let's imagine that this Arab took his Bourbonnais air back to Algeria," he continues, "and later there was a European who heard it and noted it down—what a strange idea he would have of Arab music!"[65]

The idea that music documents racial migration and racial transformation was particularly important when it came to understanding how Aryan identity itself was "constituted through diaspora."[66] Comparing folksong from not only Greece and Brittany but also Ireland and Russia and encountering "identical" aspects from one end of Europe to another, including the presence of the Hypodorian and Hypophrygian scales, led Bourgault-Ducoudray to a sweeping conclusion: this music confirms the hypothesis of shared origins of the Aryan peoples and an "Aryan unity" among peoples of the Aryan diaspora, by which he means the "Indo-European group."[67] For Bourgault-Ducoudray this meant that French composers should not feel constrained to the major and minor scales, but free to use all the Greek modes as a "heritage common to all Aryans" since before their various branches dispersed. Common roots then meant that not only did this tradition also belong to the French, they could borrow from it without risking loss of identity.

Characteristic of the Aryan diaspora, from Gobineau's perspective, was a certain imperialist orientation—"The civilizing tendencies of this elite race pushes it to constantly mix with the other peoples"—which inevitably began with conquest.[68] Colonialists such as Lanessan took this one step further, proclaiming, "The world will one day belong to the race that will have spread most widely over its surface."[69] Where the expansion in the numbers of white people was particularly important to the French was in North Africa. At the end of the century, unlike earlier, the French government, pushed by Jacques Bertillon, the statistician preoccupied with declining French birthrates, did all it could to encourage French men and women to move to Algeria. After the Franco-Prussian war, ten thousand French from Alsace and Lorraine were given land to settle there, and between 1872 and 1892 the population grew from 130,000 to 270,000 civilians.[70]

But in Algeria, colonizers also encountered a "race" of indigenous people with blond hair who "greatly resemble our peasants in the Massif centrale."[71] Long ago, so French ethnographers explained, these Kabyles (Berbers) had fled to the Algerian mountains to escape Arab invaders. The French back home saw them as a "sister population" in that, other than with their Islamic religion, they espoused a way of life resembling the French one. Their sedentary, farming culture preserved in the mountains had given them a sense of private property, a quasi-democratic organization with civil laws, and the practice of monogamy, whereas Arabs were understood as essentially nomadic, feudal, and polygamous. The distinctions of race thus transmuted into distinctions of history and culture to promote positive qualities of Kabyles, as opposed to negative qualities associated with Arabs. Kabyles, furthermore, seemed hardworking and hospitable, enamored of "absolute equality, individual liberty, and the protection of minorities"—French republican values. Some French, beginning with Alexis de Tocqueville, saw them as a kind of noble savage who might be receptive to French civilization and benefit from the contact. If the Arab race had "run its course" and the Kabyles (Berbers) had "ceased to develop many centuries ago," the latter seemed nonetheless "perfectible."[72] Others considered these mountain peoples descendents of the Celts, the Aryans, or at least a people with the same ancestors. Like the Celts, early Kabyles too were thought to be committed to freedom and equality. Emile Masqueray, who ran the Ecole Supérieure de Lettres in Alger from 1872 to 1894 and produced the only scholarly work on the Kabyles in those years, compared Kabyle villages to the primitive villages of both classical Rome and Greece as well as Auvergne and Savoy in France. He was convinced that studying these "small republics" would shed light on the "institutional origins of Western civilization."[73] This interest in Kabyles defies the notion that only the Western subject was valorized in French discussions about race.

Music was brought in to support this idea of common racial origins. Salvador Daniel, a composer who had lived in Algeria since 1853, was an enthusiast for ancient Greek music. Noting similarities between Arab and Greek instruments and Arab and Greek modes, he assumed that Arab and Kabyle music was influenced by the Greek music that Roman invaders brought with their civilization.[74] However, after transcribing several versions of songs and finding the same mode and character, he went further. Fascinated with the warrior music the Kabyles performed in their resistance to the French military, much of it using a scale that resembled the Greek Phrygian, he became convinced that the Kabyles were descendents of the ancient Greeks. He contended that since (1) Kabyle songs often used the Phrygian mode as Plutarch described it; (2) Kabyle songs in this mode were usually accompanied by the flute, according to Plutarch also as in ancient Greece; and (3) certain religious customs of contemporary Kabyles were "reproductions" of the sacred rites of the Phrygian Cabires, then the Kabyles were descendents of the "the great family of the Pélasges, first inhabitants of Phrygia and fathers of the cabiric caste."[75] Gobineau had identified the Pélasges as the "primitive inhabitants" of France, "Celtic or Slave in origin."[76] Moreover, the presence of the Phrygian mode in French *chansons populaires* and cabiric-like sacrifices among the Celtic Gauls suggested that the Celtic family belonged to the Greek Pélasges. This would imply that the French and the Kabyles had similar ancestors.[77] Common origins would also justify French colonialism.

French Racial Hybridity

Why some French might have assumed that the Kabyles would be capable of assimilation, even desire it, can be explained in part by their own history. From Michelet to Deleuze and Guattari, many French have seen themselves as a mixed race, the descendent of many peoples, as were the Greeks with whom they compared themselves.[78] The original Gauls were colonized by Romans from the south, then invaded by Franks from the north. Historians usually tended to view these arrivals in a positive light. Schoolchildren were taught that Romans civilized "rude Gauls" and Franks rejuvenated "decadent Gallo-Romans." France, the "fruit of conquest," emerged from the successful assimilation and integration of outsiders and the various influences they brought.[79]

When the Société d'Anthropologie was formed in 1860, the first paper delivered to them by its founder, Paul Broca, was on the ethnology of France. Broca wished to use the example of the French to take on Gobineau, who had claimed that "*fusions*" necessarily corrupt and degrade the qualities of the pure races, and that people "degenerate in proportion to the mixtures they submit to and the quality of these mixtures."[80] Gobineau had ended his *Essai* with the observation that the white race was slowly disappearing and only currently represented by "*hybrides*," "degradations of the first mixed societies."[81] Broca proposed instead that, in the case of the French, mixing had caused no loss of fertility, vigor, or intelligence: "Far from decaying, in accordance with the theory of Gobineau, far from presenting a decreasing fecundity, according to some other authors, this hybrid nation grows every day in intelligence, prosperity, and numbers."[82] In his *Mémoire sur hybridité et sur la distinction des espèces animales* (1858–59) and *Mémoire sur les phénomènes d'hybridité dans le genre humain* (1859–60) (which influenced Darwin), he had argued that since crossbreeding was possible among different animal species (such as a rabbit and a hare), producing "*métis*" or "hybrids," racial variety in humans too was not due to climate or chance. The French exemplify "eugenesic hybridity," a people "formed by the intermixture [*croisement*] of two or more races" that is "indefinitely prolific." Because this was the result "not of one invasion, but of a constant and abundant immigration . . . the fusion of the ethnological elements gives rise to a hybrid population in which the number of individuals of a pure race is constantly diminishing." In more than ninety-five percent of the French, he observed, one could recognize the "characters of mixed races," that is, "the more or less marked and dominant impress of the Celts, Kimris, Romans, and Germans." He also concluded, "the greater part of Western Europe is inhabited by mixed races." Where he differs with monogenists, who believed that all human crossbreeds are prolific, Broca suggests that some mixing among distant races can be unproductive.[83]

Reflecting general interest in how people and their cultures interact, in 1861, as in 1814, the Académie des Beaux-Arts chose *Atala* as the libretto for the Prix de Rome competition. As literary scholars have pointed out, this story, rendered famous in Chateaubriand's 1801 novella written after he visited America, concerns "both the limits and promises of cultural mixture" between Atala, an American Indian princess fathered by a Spanish general and raised as a Christian, and Chactas, a Natchez raised by this same general.[84] Chateaubriand uses characters who both consider themselves mixed, Atala pagan and Christian, and Chactas Indian and European, to challenge the notion that primitive and civilized societies are ethical opposites.[85] Conservatoire director Théodore Dubois wrote the winning cantata in 1861, praised for its clarity. Later, as the subject grew more politicized, three women composed more substantial works on the subject, Rita Strohl an orchestral suite, *Atala et Réné* (1887), the Viscountess de Grandval a *poème lyrique* in 1888, and Juliette Folville an opera in 1892.

Although the forming of something hybrid tends to involve antagonism, resistance, and subjugation, and vastly different theories have arisen to explain how and why this may have worked in France, the key seems to be the concept of assimilation. Renan associated this with the "great races, the Aryans and Semites," who, he believed, were "destined to assimilate all others," even if this meant "extermination" of "inferior" or so-called "half-races."[86] Many have pointed to the pronounced capacity for assimilation among the French, associating it with their "natural curiosity" and "openness" to culture and education. At the end of the nineteenth century, the sociologist Alfred Fouillé used a musical metaphor to describe how, because of this, over time these different peoples, each with their own set of assets and liabilities, came into "a rare and precious harmony." Careful to point out what each race contributed to the mixture, Fouillé suggested how the French escaped physical and environmental determinism by becoming like a perfect chord with the Celts, Mediterraneans, and Germans as their "tonic, mediant, and dominant," their mental as well as physical attributes in "balance and equilibrium."[87] As such, his contemporaries could see themselves as "representing Europe in terms of race and character as well as climate," the greatest representative of Western civilization.[88] Such an idea spoke to French ambitions about their place in Europe and was meant to bolster their sense of superiority amid the fin-de-siècle panic over possible degeneration.

French musicians and music historians likewise considered the capacity for assimilation, along with the spirit of eclecticism, as characteristic of "the artistic tastes of our race." The historian and concert organizer Henry Lavoix *fils* began his 1891 history of French music with a reference to traces the Celts, Gauls, Romans, Franks, and Germans left behind in French music, particularly their instruments.[89] The aesthetician, pianist, and pedagogue Antoine Marmontel pointed to the French passion for the music of other countries, especially Italy and Germany, and the tendency of French musicians to "combine schools and styles without renouncing their own originality."[90] Meyerbeer and Lully were embraced as French by what they contributed to French culture.[91] From the French perspective, "acclimatization" made possible assimilation. Some hoped it might lead to innovation.[92]

Transcribers of French *chansons populaires* showed through their arrangements how acclimatization of a melody might work. Collectors and scholars occasionally changed an interval to make a dominant cadence and inevitably added harmony and other accoutrements of Western art song, including instrumental introductions, interludes, and codas, to make them accessible to sophisticated urban audiences. Julien Tiersot "dressed them with the clothes of harmony" so that in "transporting them into a context so different from their natural context" they would not be too "*dépaysé* [like fish out of water]" and could be admitted "into a world that would not accept them in their bare simplicity." That Tiersot listed himself on concert programs as the author of the *chansons populaires* he published showed that he recognized their status as musical hybrids.[93] In transcribing *chansons populaires* from Greece and Brittany, Bourgault-Ducoudray also added harmony, but one based on the melody's mode. His goal was to show that modes were compatible with modern music and could be explored and incorporated for the sake of French musical progress, a kind of musical colonization.[94]

Acclimatization in music was perceived to have tangible benefits, but also predictable limitations. From it composers formed new sounds and achieved original effects even if borrowed melodies and their accompaniments at first seemed incompatible. But those who borrowed from the vast repertoire of indigenous song were often content to acclimatize exotic modes or exotic tunes to suit Western purposes without acknowledging their presence. For example, whether Bizet was inspired by Arabic, Greek, or Phrygian music or unconscious of the connection, Lacome found the mode *asbein*, "le mode du diable" with its tritone, sung by Carmen in his opera.[95] Some thought it was enough of a *tour de force* to accompany borrowed melodies with a "rational succession of chords." In seeking themes "to bend under their laws and force to enter into the framework of their compositions," they proceeded like colonialists.[96]

In "Rhapsodie mauresque" from his *Suite Algérienne*, Saint-Saëns showed what can be accomplished through hybridity even if this rendered a work difficult to understand. The second half incorporates Arabic melodies, at first in the woodwinds and percussion, then echoed (and assimilated) by the strings. After juxtaposing timbres, themes, and temperaments, the last third of the work insistently superimposes two meters and two tonalities, the triple-meter theme in A over the static duple-meter accompaniment in D. As Ralph Locke has pointed out, this "contrasting sequence of moods and meters" refers to those of North African *nuba* ensembles;[97] it also suggests how Arab and Western musical practices can coexist and even collaborate. As if to foreground his Western skills, the composer accompanies an Arab theme with itself moving in contrary direction in a way that recalls Western counterpoint. Elsewhere, overt modal differences between an Arab theme and its accompaniment "give the illusion of a melody without accompaniment." This metric and tonal "indecision" and "uncertainty," together with the "compromise" underlying the "rational succession of the chords"[98]— a kind of "in-between" or "zone of intersection" that results in "unresolved and unresolvable hybridity"[99]—is a kind of metaphor for the uneasy and imbalanced cultural coexistence under colonialism. Because acclimatization ignores the effects of displacement and disjunction on objects themselves and their meaning, borrowed exotic melodies often lose their most distinctive characteristics when combined with Western musical procedures. One critic threw his hands up at the possibility of true assimilation: "European music, Oriental music, these are two distinct, often opposed organisms, in any case as far one from the other as Aryan languages are from Semitic ones."[100] Making possible new uses of music inevitably entailed removing meaning—tradition and history—ascribed by previous users and replacing this with new meaning. In this sense, musical borrowings reduced varieties of difference to the category of difference, sometimes collapsing into the binarism of Self–Other. To the extent that new uses fixed the borrowed object, its commodification could derail music's capacity to signify in meaningful ways.

Faced with the distance and difference of foreign cultures, music, therefore, could suggest what transcended cultural constraints. But it could also express the limits of assimilation and unveil unforeseen consequences of hybridity. French intellectuals were particularly concerned that the latter might lead to a potential loss of vitality, such as Gobineau feared with racial mixing. The question of whether France had become a "great degenerate," or was merely suffering from the "moral and social crisis common to all modern nations," preoccupied them.[101] The monogenist historian Henri Martin, in his study of the ancient Gauls, had pointed to a connection between social and material progress and "moral weakening" that had led earlier to the race's "decadence" and vulnerability to foreign conquest.[102] But some, and not just polygenists, questioned whether racial hybridity itself was a prelude to racial degeneration, a catastrophic loss of the character most identified with a race.[103] The monogenist biologist and anthropologist Armand de Quatrefages understood acclimatization as the victory of milieu over an organism that "bends to its requirements" [the milieu's], adapting in ways that could jeopardize the organism's integrity. He also acknowledged that this never takes place without a more or less violent struggle that leads to loss for both individuals and generations.[104] Debussy described this in music, criticizing the influence of the Belgian César Franck's "sentimental rigor" on Ernest Chausson's "natural talents of elegance and clarity":

> To think that the particular qualities of the genius of a race can be transmitted to another race without harm is an error that has often perverted our music because with unsuspecting enthusiasm we adopt formulas in which nothing French can appear. It would be better to confront these with our own, to see what lacks in us, and to try to recover it without changing anything in the rhythm of our thought. In this way we will enrich our heritage.[105]

In his review of the Opéra's controversial decision to mount Wagner's *Lohengrin* in 1891, Jules Ruelle, a critic and translator of operatic libretti, went further, claiming that humanity has nothing to gain from a "universal mixture. . . . The conquest of which we dream—absolute fusion—will be the ruin or the impoverishment of one of the great forces of humanity."[106] While many thought the time had come for French composers to "break away from the influence of foreign styles," some, however, rejected the notion of French culture in decline. Marmontel explained that the tutelage of French composers by their neighbors was no longer necessary because "we are now energetic, lively, and original enough by ourselves."[107]

If at home fear was directed at an increase in European immigrants and the social instability that might follow, in Algeria some dreamed of a new "fusion" of European races.[108] Anthropologists who worked on Algeria believed, like Broca, that when hybridity results from "proximate species" as opposed to distant ones, "unions between allied races are fertile."[109] Those who thought that the Arabs could never be assimilated, in part because of their religion, looked to the Spanish, Italian, and Maltese living in Algeria to join the French in forming a "new Mediterranean race," a vigorous and virile product of the intermingling of Europeans and locals willing to embrace France.[110] Given a high birthrate among these Latin peoples, Paul Bert thought they might one day dominate Algeria.[111] Noting the Roman ruins in North Africa, Louis Bertrand, a native of Lorraine who taught at the Algiers lycée, saw the region as originally part of a Latin Mediterranean diaspora. Reyer's opera *Salammbô* had drawn his attention to racial mixing in North Africa, and works of Fromentin suggested the continued existence of a "fundamental Mediterranean being."[112] Music, along with trade and commerce, was central in this project to create a settler community distinct from the Arabs. As elsewhere outside the West, opera attendance provided elites and those of European descent with a context for performing their difference from indigenous people.[113] Moreover, in 1878 an Italian musician organized Algiers's first classical music society. Although at first it featured more Italian and German than French music,[114] performing and listening to Western classical music provided settlers with a sense of the culture they shared, its assumed superiority, and an ongoing connection to the world beyond North Africa. Racial hybridity among whites from related cultures thus justified the French presence in North Africa. If culture and civilization were seen as primary determinants and signifiers of this new Mediterranean race, it could exclude indigenous people, including the Kabyles, especially after 1900, when the new colonial policy of association replaced assimilation. Ironically what inspired the vitality of these new "Algerians" was the Muslim "whose sole aim was to endure."[115]

Racial Resistance

Along with this consensus on the hybrid nature of the French people came ambivalence, especially when it came to mixing with indigenous people in the colonies. Young calls this "an ambivalent axis of desire and aversion." Many agreed with Broca that if mixing closely related varieties can have advantages, among distantly related races it can threaten to erase the distinctions of difference.[116] Renan believed that to feel like a nation, the French needed to forget their past. Others set their sights on a more distant past, seeking evidence of racial persistence to instill in the French people a sense of unity. No matter what education, racial mixture, or degeneration might bring, they suggested, race leaves its trace, like the Greek modes in French *chansons populaires*. Tiersot called this the "charming debris of our race's primitive art."[117]

Persistence resulted from resistance, or concerted opposition to domination, assimilation, and loss of identity. Daniel associated the use of the Phrygian mode in Kabyle warrior songs with not only their strength and ferocity, but also their pride in "always having remained free," that is, until French colonialism. The French admired the Kabyles for their resistance, "obeying neither the Arab nor the Turk,"[118] especially since their unwillingness to go along with the Arabs ultimately led to French victory. Indeed, in Indochina as well as Algeria, it was an explicit tactic of the French military to valorize the resistance of indigenous minorities to previous invaders as a way of building an alliance with them against those in power. After the French loss to the Prussians in 1871, the Persian resistance to Arab occupation, noted by Weber in their music,[119] offered a model to the French for how a people could maintain their culture and identity even under foreign occupation.

The most important example of resistance for the French in their own history was that of primitive Gauls to the Romans, ever appealing even today through the Asterix comics series. Both Amédée Thierry's *Histoire des Gaulois* and Henri Martin's *Histoire de France* considered the Gauls the race from which most French descended. As these widely read historians put it, "their spirit is always in us, their vices and virtues preserved in the heart of the French people."[120] Renowned for their taste for adventure, their bravery, and their impetuous, intelligent spirit, the ancient Gauls were celebrated as conquerors who dominated Europe as far as Greece. They reputedly belonged to the great Indo-European family that came from Arie (Turkestan), "white and blond" Aryans who were divided into several independent people. Tiersot considered military songs the Gauls' "first monuments." Such ancestors, according to written documents, had the habit of going into battle singing. When their armies marched, "their melodious accents chased away the fury of the souls." Roman writers attested to the "bloody songs" that accompanied the Gauls' first invasion of the Roman republic.[121] Through the strength of these ancestors, historians could portray as essential to the French the Gallic warrior spirit. This spirit allowed the Gauls to keep their identity despite invasion and later occupation by the

Romans and the Franks. Race, in this sense, refers to a "moral type" as described above, a kind of "psychic continuity"[122] that underlies conflict, even with stronger others, and whatever assimilation and integration may take place in peacetime. This ability to resist complete domination, in spite of defeat, was crucial to those who wished to revive French pride after 1871 and kindle the desire to return to war.

In the wake of the Franco-Prussian war, writers, playwrights, painters, sculptors, and composers embraced the Gallic warrior wholeheartedly so as to inspire patriotism and nourish French confidence in their military might.[123] With powerful images of bravery, their images of idealized heroes, like Vercingetorix, represented French strength and resilience as a people, emblems of the Gallic spirit unchanged over time. These were meant to help the French come together to face a common enemy. In 1882 Charles Lenepveu, a Conservatoire professor, wrote *Velléda*, an opera about war between the Gauls and the Romans based on a scene from Chateaubriand's *Les Martyrs*. Through the voice of the Gauls, it expresses French desire for revenge against the Prussians. For the Prix-de-Rome competitions in 1881, 1883, and 1888, the Académie des Beaux-Arts chose libretti about militaristic patriotism, *Geneviève*, *Le Gladiateur*, and *Velléda*, and in 1892, *Amadis*. Gobineau had just published in 1887 a 20,000-verse poem about the famous Gallic knight Amadis. In this posthumous text, Amadis, a blond and blue-eyed Breton, fellow chevalier and friend of Parceval (Parsifal), stood for the "individual man." He, Oriane, and their companions were portrayed as quintessential examples (*le type*) of the white race, representing the "perfection of mankind."[124] Shortly thereafter (c. 1895), France's leading opera composer Jules Massenet wrote a "legendary opera" on Amadis in four acts, with a text by Jules Claretie. Also set in Brittany amid Druid monuments, it features the blond, blue-eyed hero and his brother, both born unknowingly to a queen, both in love with the same woman. Like Gobineau's book 1 of his *Amadis*, it revolves around chivalry, love, and war.[125]

Among fin-de-siècle composers, Augusta Holmès was perhaps most attracted to the Gauls even though she was born Irish. Her first major work, *Lutèce*, composed in hopes of wining the City of Paris prize in 1878, was set during Gallic wars with the Romans. Holmès wrote both music and words of this dramatic symphony. After bugle-like sounds announce the departure of the troops, a narrator addresses the audience directly, making explicit an analogy between past and present: "You men who are listening to me, sons of ancient Gaul, dream of lost days of the distant past! . . . You, in whom still burns the proud blood of the ancestors . . . listen to them, live and die like them." After dawn rises over the Seine, the Gallic warrior and his wife declare their love. But instead of trying to seduce him to stay behind, she happily gives up her husband and future sons, "white and strong with blond beards." At the climax of part one, in an *allegro feroce* full of tritones, she exclaims, "Don't come back until you are wounded . . . kill, kill, kill." With harsh dissonances (D/E-flat) and musical metaphors for sword attacks, battle music follows. Finally, after the defeat of "a hundred against a thousand" and Gaul left "in the impure arms of the foreigner," the Gallic woman, accompanied by rolled chords in the harps and strings, sings exuberantly and with dotted rhythms, as if she can imagine the future of France: "The blood of heroes rejuvenates . . . saves cities . . . fertilizes devastated fields. . . . From the blood of heroes and the mothers of even more audacious sons, the most beautiful country (*cité*) will be born." These themes recur in many of Holmès's songs, particularly during the 1890s, including "La Guerrière" (a woman warrior with blond hair), "Ne nous oubliez pas" (as if sung from the dead), and "Marche gauloise." As with *Lutèce*, the message of these songs is clear: the "sons of the Gauls" must march again, taking up arms this time against the Germans. The role of music was to infuse virility and "hatred in their hearts."

The nineteenth-century quest for French origins, however, did not end with the Gauls. The archaeologist Alexandre Bertrand, disagreeing with Henri Martin and others, argued that the Celts were not a "branch" of the Gallic people, but were a distinct race that preceded the Gauls.[126] Ancient Greeks had noted Celtic presence as far as southern Germany and at the source of the Danube well before the "blonds" arrived, called by the Greeks Galates (a warrior people from Asia Minor) and by the Romans Gauls.[127] Tiersot, backing up this claim, notes that the Breton Celts sang certain warrior songs when making "incursions into the territory of their neighbors who submitted to the Franks, that is, the Gauls."[128] Pointing to the dolmen megaliths in Brittany as remnants of the earliest civilization in France and to their funeral rites, Bertrand also used archaeological evidence to suggest that the Celts were not descendants of Aryans, but of another race that arrived before them, perhaps in the Bronze Age. That, like many people of Mediterranean descent, the Celts had dark hair and eyes at the very least complicated the question of the Aryan physical type.[129] Withdrawing to the northwest coast (Brittany) and the mountainous center of the country (Auvergne) as the Romans focused on the towns and cities, the Celts were able to firmly and successfully resist both the Romans and the Germans far more than the Gauls who eventually assimilated them. Celtic language, culture, and music remained distinct, some of it up to the nineteenth century.[130] The Celts' power was believed to come from their strong attachment to druidism, led by priests and bards, a culture as compelling as that of the Greeks. Celtic bards used songs to "calm as well as enflame their warrior passions." Some, including Edouard Schuré, went so far as to see the Celtic tradition, above all, as responsible for the French character. As Schuré put it, "the Celtic soul is the deep interior soul of France." A similar sentiment motivated the composer Vincent d'Indy to write an opera, *Fervaal*, which Steven Huebner calls "an allegory about the founding of France out of the Celtic spirit." One reviewer considered Fervaal as "a Celtic hero glorifying the French race."[131] Fouillé saw the Celts' refuge in the mountains as a source of the French attachment to their soil and their families and an explanation for their conservatism.[132]

How these theories about national origins played out, however, suggests that more was at stake here than race. The Celts were thought of as a people at the heart of France not known for assimilation, but rather for their own distinctive culture untouched by Greek influences. Gobineau underlines this "resistance to being assimilated by other Aryan languages" when it came to "the Celtic dialects." Celtic songs, as he saw it, "displayed the body of knowledge acquired by their race and conserved cosmological, theological, as well as historical traditions."[133] Resisting assimilation was significant to those who opposed democracy and the republic, not viewed as indigenous to France.

For republicans, Gallic strength and resistance connoted class strength and resistance within France and economic protectionism within Europe. Historians associated the Gauls with the third estate, the people, together with their fraternal, federative, proto-democratic institutions, as opposed to the Franks, whose aristocrats brought monarchy to France and established Christianity there.[134] Fustel de Coulanges, a staunch republican professor of history at the Sorbonne, saw the conflict over racial origins as concealing the ongoing class conflict in France. It is "born of class antagonism and it grows with that antagonism."[135] In school manuals, republicans replaced Clovis, the first French monarch, with Vercingetorix, a Gallic man of the people who stood up to Caesar. Some republicans went further. With her frequent depiction of idealized French men and women as white and blond, Holmès shared with Paul Déroulède and the Ligue des Patriotes not only a cult of glory, respect for military heroism, and commitment to revenge against Prussia, but also a kind of proto-racism. Déroulède attracted many members to the Ligue des Patriotes by pointing to the menace presented by German industry, calling for boycotts of German-made products, and objecting to the "peaceful invasion" of a half million German workers in the mid-1880s. This far-right, anti-immigrant republicanism fueled a popular nationalism that momentarily brought to power General Boulanger who, with his blond beard and charismatic nature, seemed the idol many were seeking.

If models of political resistance fascinated and emboldened the French people, musical resistance too had its allure. Carried over time through the oral tradition, the notes of a folksong were thought to be the remnants of resistance to outside influences and the impact of urban civilization, pointing to a time before layers of assimilation and hybridization. Music historians, following the same logic as other historians of France, searched for the French racial origins in the mountainous center of the country. There, where the early French were thought to have taken refuge from invaders, Tiersot found music of a "more primitive and less civilized character" believed to be the oldest French music as well as the "pure and most complete" version of certain French *chansons populaires*.[136]

Whereas Tiersot, a republican, sought musical traditions in the French provinces that could promote French unity, Bourgault-Ducoudray and d'Indy, even as they built on some of Tiersot's findings, had other agendas. Both also studied various versions of *chansons populaires*, particularly those associated with the ancient Celts, but focused specifically on their modes. With intuitions similar to those of Salvador Daniel, and echoing Tiersot who found some of the "purest" Hypodorian in French Alpine songs, Bourgault-Ducoudray concluded that many of the *chansons populaires* in the French mountains and in Brittany were based on Greek modes. In the north, for example, where the "race is more serious and more reflective," he found many songs in Hypodorian, associated with the "serene virility and nobility" of Apollo.[137] Like Tiersot, Bourgault-Ducoudray also pointed to the presence of certain distinct rhythms that resembled those of ancient Greece, especially in the "Bacchu-ber," a warrior dance with swords popular in the French mountains. This choral dance used pyrrhic metrical patterns in conjunction with the Hypodorian mode. Tiersot notes, significantly, that the piece was unique: he never found these rhythms in other "*mélodies populaires* or liturgical chant based on an analogous tonality." While Tiersot does not take this as definitive proof that the dance had Greek origins, he notes that his research did not produce any evidence to the contrary.[138] However, Bourgault-Ducourday saw in these modes and rhythms a compelling argument for the persistence of Greek influence on this repertoire rather than that of the Catholic Church, especially since liturgical modes, the Western medieval modes used in church music, had lost their rhythmic character.[139] This presence allowed him to argue for the secular origins of French music, a conclusion that would have been important to republicans, many of whom were anticlerical.

"Primitive" music (music without tonal harmony) appealed to d'Indy, an anti-republican Catholic aristocrat, because it harkened back to the Middle Ages, thereby predating the Republic and its notions of French civilization as a product of assimilation.[140] From his perspective, *chansons populaires* were a music without the trace of politics or any historical consciousness. Like Tiersot and Bourgault-Ducoudray, d'Indy assumed that he would find the oldest French music preserved in the mountains. He focused on collecting, studying, and publishing songs from near his ancestors' birthplace in France's oldest mountains, including "Chansons de mai," often considered Celtic. There, because certain songs seemed to borrow elements directly from chant, he argued that the modes in this music were those of plainchant. According to his analysis, "La Pernette," reputedly one of the country's oldest songs, resembled a Gregorian alleluia. This would suggest that the origins of French music lie in religious rather than secular music. Moreover, this repertoire could help listeners reconnect with religious faith. After 1900, anti-republican provincials turned to the *chansons populaires* as a way to resist invasion by a more contemporary enemy, the Parisian romance, and helped turn the genre into a symbol of regional identity.[141]

The French construed resistance, therefore, not just among the weak resisting the strong or the invaded standing up to the invaders, but also among the elite and the privileged feeling disenfranchised by republican egalitarianism. After nostalgic monarchists lost their last hope of returning to power in 1889, the myth of Celtic purity and the example of Celtic resistance inspired them to stand up to republican culture as a form of social and political resistance. Music became for these elites a means of ensuring the continuity of their values, aristocratic values based on distinctions rather than commonality, distance rather than mass accessibility, the pure instead of the hybrid. Modernist ideals took root in such a terrain, leading to a neoclassical revival.

Racial Purity

Underlying the notion of resistance was the hope that something essential about a race could be or might have been preserved. For Broca, racial purity, an imagined essence associated with race, was only an abstract idea, because people inevitably mixed. In his work on the Celts, Broca had tried to refute the myth of a pure race; he saw anthropology as the "study of the human group." But for Gobineau and others, the "absolute and true purity of race" is responsible for the "resemblances among its individuals." Gobineau tied racial purity to not only origins, but also blood. He was concerned about the percentage of "pure," i.e., non-mixed, blood in a person or race, fearing racial degeneration and its deleterious impact on nations.[142] Gobineau, a count whose family remained loyal to the Bourbons, detested democracy and mourned the demise of the French aristocracy, as if its inbreeding had preserved something essential.[143] When republicans came into power in the late 1870s, he wrote books 2 and 3 of *Amadis*, the first on the decadence of modern society, the second on its "definitive degeneration and disappearance," metaphors for his fears about the end of Western civilization. Here, Amadis was the last hero to "succumb to the always increasingly large crowd of crossbreeds (*foule métisse*)." At the end, in a section title borrowed from Wagner ("The Dusk of the Gods"), his soul, claiming immortality on the battlefield, rises to the heavens.[144]

The idea that the nature of one's "soul" (and therefore one's art) depends on the purity of one's blood, as Gobineau and Le Bon suggested, was a conceptually attractive, although highly questionable, corollary. In music, blood in conjunction with racial purity came up frequently in referring to the vitality of *chansons populaires*, as if an injection of these songs might infuse new spirit, and a specifically French spirit, into French music. With elements that were "purely preserved everywhere," such as opening formulas, folksongs far from urban centers fueled nostalgia for an idealized fixed identity among the French, one that preexisted their hybridity. In this context, blood was believed to be capable of carrying culture along with cultural predispositions. As Tiersot put it, "numerous generations will keep on repeating it," for this music is "in the blood of the race."[145] Faced with two kinds of folksong in Brittany, one in gallot, a dialect influenced by French, the other in Breton, Bourgault-Ducoudray, using similar language, criticized the former and the melodies using the gallot for being "half-blood," not having "the character of a pure race." He preferred the latter, with its melodies that left a more "strange impression," considering these "pure-blood."[146] Ironically, given his interest in simplicity and clarity in the genre, it was strangeness that seemed the most authentic, the most "pure."

Often in French musical discourse, however, the word "pure," with all its connotations, referred to intonation and a certain kind of tone quality. In describing the oldest folksongs in the French mountains, Tiersot speaks of their "pure inflexions," notes prolonged by an echo.[147] At the same time, he also notes that the "popular instinct" was drawn to "irregularities," enjoying the "unexpected" in a melody.[148] In French ethnographies of non-Western music, however, these concepts served to underline racial hierarchies. For Weber, people whose music employs "very irregular intonations" are necessarily "the most uneducated and savage nations." Some blamed this on deficiencies in the auditory acuity of primitive people, although in Frank Bruner's 1904 study some blacks had better hearing than whites.[149] The presence of a "certain feeling for intonation" in Senegalese balafon music leads Tiersot to point to "a certain progress over the rhythmic practices of people for whom the drum is all music." The breaking point for both Weber and Tiersot seems to be the extent to which music is melodic, not just a succession (or simultaneity) of timbres. "Pure" intonation, or highly refined sound used to produce melodies, he reserves for highly refined civilizations, especially that of Western Europe. When in Greek theoretical treatises Weber finds "chroni," "nuances of intonation consisting of inaccurate sounds," he dismisses them as merely momentary "aberrations" before a return to the diatonic scale; likewise for quarter tones in this music, which he attributes to Arab influence.

While virtuosity and timbral variety in instrumental music were esteemed as the highest ideal of European music, a result of Europeans' continual "search for the new,"[150] singers of French opera in the late nineteenth century strove for a certain purity of timbre. In this sense, the "pure" in art was opposed to that which involved technical complexity. Alluding to the essence of sound, it functioned as an aural analogue to "pure water," the "source" with its "quiet murmuring" at which Gerald and Lakmé declared their love and the rain that Mélisande's voice felt like to Pelléas in their duo. This quality enabled "true expression," which Marmontel considered "the most important characteristic of French music."[151] Besides the "déclamation épurée" of Marguerite's first appearance in Gounod's *Faust*, the best example of this is in Ambroise Thomas's *Mignon*. The contrasting musical styles of Mignon and Philine, simple versus highly ornamented, embody their different characters, the sweet and innocent versus the seductive and manipulative. The pure was an ideal performance of the simple. Mignon's clear, simple melodies facilitated concentration on timbre, and the production of a pure timbre encouraged transparency between singer and character, drawing listeners in and encouraging a deep connection with Mignon. Reviewers saw this as a product of the composer's "science rentrée," or his considerable knowledge and skill used to produce the appearance of simple grace.[152] Singers of such music, perhaps responding to audience desire, were obsessed with reducing variance in vocal sound production, all presence of the particular, or what Roland Barthes has called "the grain of the voice," even if voices and instruments need that "grain" to be recognizable. In an important sense, seeking a pure sound meant transcending the limitations of identity. The word "pure" does not call for eliminating foreign influences on musical style, invoke national origins, or instantiate an essentialist perspective. French music, after all, was generally recognized as the product of assimilating German and Italian elements. Indeed, that vocal purity and melodic simplicity were so highly valorized by a people who saw themselves as the most hybrid in Europe is an intriguing irony. Rather, I would suggest, "pure" refers to a quality that rises above nation and national differences within the West, beyond the particularities as expressed in Western languages, even as this very ambition to universality coded it as specifically Western. *Mignon* could be performed in many languages and by singers with diverse accents and from widely varying backgrounds, and they were consistently praised to the extent that they could produce a pure sound.[153] Understood and valued across Europe at the fin de siècle, this kind of refined sound, devoid of the distinctions of individual voice and national language, defined for them Western music at its finest.[154]

As such, pure intonation was a musical analogue for whiteness, signifying a desire to grapple with Western identity at its most fundamental. Both involved the perception of an absence of color, a quality functioning as and valued for being unmarked rather than marked. As such, both were products of Eurocentrism, analogues for what Westerners saw themselves as sharing while inhibiting appreciation of highly complex timbral musicality outside the West, such as in North Indian dhrupad or Japanese bunraku singing. Just as the concept of racial purity may have connoted a quality shared among white Europeans, although, as Renan pointed out, racial purity did not exist among Europeans—everyone was mixed[155]—it was an ideal more than an attainable reality, a "perfection" that could only be approximated. Joined to "noble," "pure" connoted transcendence from material and mundane concerns, a taste for elevated ideas, or the refined world of the upper classes. When the City of Paris created a prize for the "purest and most abstract form" of music, they did not mean music without text or story—the competition was for a dramatic symphony. Rather, composers were told to address "feelings of the highest order,"[156] words the Frenchman used to translate "la grande race" in reference to Saint-Saëns. When Ernest Reyer wrote of the need to "refine (*épurer*) public taste," he was calling for a higher goal than entertainment, something elevated and noble.[157] Praise for having a pure style or creating a pure design in music had similar connotations. Given its association with the music of Mozart and Mendelssohn, this would have suggested that a composer's music was on a par with the achievements of German classicism. Some associated this yearning to go beyond material reality with advanced civilization, its abstraction and attempt to contemplate what Mallarmé called the "au-delà" distinguishing it from "primitive" musics.[158] Indeed, Renan characterized a race's distinction from the "inferior races" by its ability to strive for an ideal, its "transcendental capacities signifying the nobility of man."[159] Ultimately, then, pure whiteness and pure intonation, however abstract the concepts, were unifying strategies among Western Europeans, particularly important amid ongoing conflicts that could explode into war, and ways of ensuring Westerners' perception of their superiority as they entered into colonial relationships with more and more of the world's peoples.

Idealism and Identity

We've seen that different racial beliefs had a great impact on how the French saw themselves as well as others, especially their diverse past and their hopes for the future. Whereas polygenists wanted to blame racial mixing for the impending decline of French mores at the fin de siècle, monogenists saw benefits in the racial hybridity that was France, the new Rome, the product of assimilating ancient Greek and Roman traditions through the Gauls and German traditions through the Franks. For them, this combination, this amalgam of characteristics, was perceived as part of their strength as a people. At some point, however, their hyper-awareness of their own hybridity perhaps inhibited the French from understanding what it means when colonized peoples have no interest in assimilation. They may have assumed they understood the processes needed to integrate another people, but, largely Eurocentric, as we've seen in their conclusions about non-Western music, they remained unable or unwilling to understand non-Western difference in its own terms. Because they failed to rise to the challenges of an expanded French nation, prejudice and discrimination remained, even among those who believed in "liberty, equality, and fraternity."

When the term *race* appeared in reference to the French as if a homogenous entity, it was in some ways a term of desire as well as self-delusion, clouded with implications related to French politics, class, and national identity. Both republicans and monarchists seized on the notion of music as a sign and symbol of race because, to them both, it idealized a certain identity associated with their ancestors, whether revolutionaries or aristocratic monarchists, even if these were in some ways as distinct and diametrically opposed as the Gauls and the Franks. Race's stand-in, purity, could also simultaneously signify class. Purity permeated the discourse on a wide range of musics, musicians, and performance practices, often signaling high achievement and the distinction associated with class. To the extent that French music and musical practices achieved purity in style or sound, such as in *Mignon*, they also helped the French address an identity based not on the particularities of language, but instead on its universal possibilities (from a Western perspective). When French musicians could "proclaim superiority in musical lyricism"[160] and French taste was appreciated as universal taste, the ultimate mark of its legitimacy, the French were rewarded with what underlay any search for national identity, that is, international recognition and respect. So many agendas related to the Self may help explain why studies examining non-Western music were full of highly subjective assumptions and conclusions.

Despite all the complexity and nuance the word had come to signify, particularly in studies of the French past, in time of war, race collapsed to blood and narrow definitions of national identity. Colonialists had already admitted the failure of assimilation in the colonies, and French leaders had retreated to the tactics of distanced association, borrowed from British colonialism. With the horrors of World War I came a retrenchment to old fears of invaders, occupation, and the inevitability of foreign influence along with abstract notions of racial purity as related to blood. As Debussy put it strongly and boldly in one of his last published essays, victory would bring a "necessary liberation" to the "French musical consciousness," returning to French artists "a sense of the purity and the nobility of the French blood."[161] Here, purity is the antithesis of the corrupt, a theme earlier associated with the medieval conflict between the Gallo-Romans and the Franks. If Fouillé, explicitly antiwar in the 1890s, accepted what each people had contributed over time to the French nation, he did not agree with Germans that their ancestors were "the great purifiers of Latin corruption."[162] However, amid renewed conflict, this idea of war as redeeming corruption returned. If war could remind the French of "all the virtues of our race," as Debussy ardently hoped, it was because it enhanced self-awareness. This could purify in the sense of cleansing them of their errors, ridding them of seductions that were false and influences that went against their nature. Debussy specifically called for French musicians to uproot the "weeds" in themselves and their culture and thereby rediscover their "liberty." "There are several ways to defeat the enemy," he continued. "Music is one of them; admirable and fertile."[163] Able to produce as well as embody identity, music's role, from the "Marseillaise" to that of Holmès and Debussy, was to fertilize the "devastated fields" of the French soul and thereby ensure French immortality.

While race as national identity had encouraged a sense of geopolitical unity among the French people, a connection beyond differences of class and politics, it also empowered a sense of strength and indomitability vis-à-vis others. At the same time, white Eurocentrism in discussions of origins, hierarchies, hybridity, and resistance shaped what the French wanted to understand or even could understand when it came to race beyond the nation. To grasp this and therefore how they acted as an imperial power, we need to understand what race meant to them at home. Racial hybridity, as conceived by anthropologists, was an observable fact, but the notion of mixing that would lessen or eradicate racial distinctions between distantly related races was unpredictable, frightening. After the war, the eventual migration to France of thousands from the colonies challenged the French attempt to recognize some kind of homogeneity among their people, beyond their citizenship. And in the colonies, assimilation remained an often unrealizable ideal for those sympathetic to the project, or a violent imposition of French values for those opposing it. In effect, it has long been far easier for the French to aim for plurality based on European whiteness and distinction within Western culture than to redress inequalities and abolish racism, particularly "racism without races."[164]

When the socialists came to power in the early 1980s, they reinvested in Third Republic ideals and targeted intervention to promote their agendas. They gave grants to support French rap and rai, and at the annual Fête de la musique on June 22, which they founded in 1982, such musicians were often given center stage, playing for huge crowds in front of the Assemblée Nationale and Les Invalides. The festival's founder Maurice Fleuret, composer and arts administrator, explained, "If we invite musicians to come play in the street, it is so that they celebrate their own existence and begin to know themselves and one another better, so that they fraternize with others."[165] Over the years, organizers have continued to invite "the musical practices of everyone without any hierarchy of genres," seeking to "foster self-knowledge and the formation of groups" as well as "revitalize society in crisis by helping to alleviate the identity crisis of victims of the new global economy." Through the participation of amateurs at all levels and the subway and train lines left running all night during the Fête—which allowed those living in the suburbs to participate in urban performances—they have hoped to "reconcile the imaginary and the political through musical performance." In recent years, especially as the festival has gone international in over 250 countries, their press releases describe music as having become "mosaic" and "the expression of musical and cultural crossbreeding [*métissages*]" without any pejorative connotations.[166] Within France, the “musiques du mondes et traditions [world music and traditional music]” category has outstripped classical music and even jazz on these performances largely initiated and organized by amateurs, and mixed genres, or “fusion,” often incorporating aspects of world music, are by far the most frequent. French officials thus have looked to music to bring together people of different backgrounds and ethnicities and suggest ways of negotiating their differences. The challenge of fully assimilating people into French society, however, has never been more daunting.

Notes

Jann Pasler, music scholar, documentary filmmaker, and pianist, is professor of music at the University of California, San Diego, where she founded the graduate program, Critical Studies and Experimental Practices (CSEP). She has published widely on French music, contemporary American music, modernism, and postmodernism. Recently she has completed *Writing through Music* (Oxford University Press, 2008) and *Music as Public Utility*, (University of California Press, forthcoming). The article in this issue is part of her next book, *Music, Race, and Colonialism in Fin-de-siècle France*. Email: jpasler@ucsd.edu

I’m grateful to Annegret Fauser and Tamara Levitz for their perceptive, provocative, and very constructive comments on an earlier draft of this article.

1. Herrick Chapman and Laura Frader, “Introduction: Race in France,” in their *Race in France: Interdisciplinary Perspectives on the Politics of Difference* (New York: Berghahn, 2004), 1–3.

2. More recently, Homi K. Bhabha, “The Postcolonial and the Postmodern,” in *The Location of Culture* (London: Routledge, 1994), addresses this concern, defining culture as a “strategy of survival.” He notes: “The transnational dimension of cultural transformation—migration, diaspora, displacement, relocation—makes the process of cultural translation a complex form of signification. The natural[ized], unifying discourse of ‘nation,’ ‘peoples,’ or authentic ‘folk’ tradition, those embedded myths of culture’s particularity, cannot be readily referenced. The great, though unsettling, advantage of this position is that it makes you increasingly aware of the construction of culture and the invention of tradition” (172).

3. Many nineteenth-century writers, such as Kipling, presented colonial encounters as consisting of “absolute” divisions between the colonized and colonizers; recent scholars, such as Edward Said, have focused on this “uneven exchange” (*Orientalism* [New York: Vintage, 1978], 12, and *Culture and Imperialism* [New York: Knopf, 1993], 134). Paul Leroy-Beaulieu, in *De la Colonisation chez les peuples modernes* (1874; Paris: Guillaumin, 1882), however, had a more nuanced view of this. He acknowledged that colonization involves an “exchange of influences, a reciprocity of services, and mutual dependence.” This was a corollary to another point: while migrations (of savage peoples) are driven by instinct, colonialism (by civilized peoples) is characterized by conscious reflection (xi–xii). Discourse of inclusion, however, did not always translate into practices. On *métissage* [interracial unions] in French Indo-China, see Ann Laura Stoler, “Sexual

Affronts and Racial Frontiers: European Identities and the Cultural Politics of Exclusion in Colonial Southeast Asia," in *Hybridity and Its Discontents: Politics, Science, Culture*, ed. Avtar Brah and Annie Coombes (London and New York: Routledge, 2000), 21–55. On sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Europe as a product of colonizers and colonized and how music played a role in these distinctions, see Olivia Bloechl, in *Native American Song at the Frontiers of Early Modern Music* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008). Michael Werner and Michel Espagne in *Transferts: Les relations interculturelles dans l'espace franco-allemand (XVIII^e et XIX^e siècle)*, ed. Werner and Espagne (Paris: Editions Recherche sur les Civilisations, 1988), and Annegret Fauser in this volume use "cultural transfer" to describe cultural exchange as a reciprocal phenomenon both inter- and intra-culturally. I'm grateful to Olivia and Annegret for sharing their work in advance of publication.

4. *Civilization* differs from the term often given as the German equivalent, *culture*. While the latter is a product and suggests relative autonomy from the Other, the former is a process involving relative openness. Walter Mignolo discusses these differences drawn from Norbert Elias's *The Civilizing Process* (1937) in his "Globalization, Civilization Processes, and the Relocation of Languages and Cultures," in *Cultures of Globalization*, ed. Frederic Jameson and Masao Miyoshi (Durham and London: Duke University Press, 1998), 32–34. He also notes that whereas civilization "can be carried and expanded all over the globe," culture is more rooted in space.

5. See, for example, Alfred Fouillé, "Dégénérescence? Le passé et le présent de notre race," *Revue des deux mondes* 131 (1895): 793–824 ; Robert Nye, *Crime, Madness, and Politics: The Medical Concept of National Decline* (Princeton, NJ : Princeton University Press, 1984); and Karen Offen, "Depopulation, Nationalism, and Feminism in Fin-de-Siècle France," *American Historical Review* 89, no. 3 (June 1984): 648–76.

6. See, most recently, Annegret Fauser, *Musical Encounters at the 1889 Paris World's Fair* (Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2005), 146–58; Ralph Locke's classic study, "Constructing the Oriental 'Other': Saint-Saëns's *Samson et Dalila*," *Cambridge Opera Journal* 3 (Nov. 1991): 261–302; and Jane Fulcher, *French Cultural Politics and Music* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1999), especially 193–94, where she assumes that any use of the term *race* should be understood in terms of the "rhetoric" associated with the Action Française.

7. Because such discourses can also be "driving forces in history, and not merely representations," as Tzvetan Todorov argues in *On Human Diversity: Nationalism, Racism, and Exoticism in French Thought*, trans. Catherine Porter (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1993), xiii, these concerns had larger implications that music helped to illuminate.

8. Camille Benoit, "La Musique et la philosophie moderne. I. (suite) Charles Darwin," *Revue et gazette musicale* (29 Feb. 1880): 67.

9. Paul Broca, *On the Phenomena of Hybridity in the Genus Homo*, ed. C. Carter Blake (London: Longman, Green, Longman, and Roberts, 1864), 8–9, 12.

10. Todorov, *On Human Diversity*, 90, 102.

11. Todorov, *On Human Diversity*, 102–3; Gobineau, *Essai sur l'inégalité des races humaines*, in *Oeuvres*, vol. 1 (1853; Paris: Gallimard, 1983), 813; Broca, *Hybridity in the Genus Homo*, 7.

12. Gobineau, *Essai*, 341, 347–48. Ernest Renan, in *Histoire générale et système comparé des langues sémitiques* (Paris: Michel Lévy, 1863), concurred, believing that the Indo-European and Semitic races "have in common, and are alone in possessing, the sovereign characteristic of beauty." They were "the civilized family" (490–91).

13. Gobineau, *Essai*, 793–94.

14. Renan elaborates this notion of the nation in his "Qu'est-qu'une nation?" (1882), reproduced in *Le Nationalisme français*, ed. Raoul Girardet (Paris: Seuil, 1983), 65–67. In his *La Réforme intellectuelle et morale*, ed. P. E. Charvet (1871; New York: Greenwood, 1968), he notes that Alsace was a "Celtic country" before being invaded by the German race (121). See also his *Histoire*, especially 500–505.

15. Gustave Le Bon, *The Psychology of Peoples* (1894; New York: Stechert, 1924), 37, 126. See also Hippolyte Taine, *Les Origines de la France contemporaine* (1876–96).

16. Gabriel Tarde, *Les Lois d'imitation* (Paris: Alcan, 1890), 21n1. See also Tarde and Edmund Demolins, cited in Pierre-André Taguieff, *The Force of Prejudice: Racism and Its Doubles*, trans. Hassan Melehy (Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press, 2001), 75.

17. Antoine Marmontel, *Eléments d'esthétique musicale et considération sur le beau dans les arts* (Paris: Heugel, 1884), 418.

18. Claude Debussy, in *L'Intransigeant* (11 Mar. 1915), reproduced in *Monsieur Croche et autres écrits*, ed. François Lesure (Paris: Gallimard, 1971), 260.

19. Gabriel Vicaire, "Nos Idées sur le traditionnisme," *Revue des traditions populaires* (25 July 1886): 189; "Les Chansons populaires au Cercle Saint-Simon," *Revue des traditions populaires* (26 Feb. 1887): 138.

20. L. A. Bourgault-Ducoudray, *Trente Mélodies populaires de Basse-Bretagne* (Paris: Lemoine, 1885), 16.

21. Albert Lavignac, *La Musique et les musiciens français* (Paris: Delagrave, 1895), 432; Debussy, *S.I.M.* (1 Nov. 1913), reproduced in *Monsieur Croche*, 241. Likewise, in order for French composers not to be "taken over" by German influences, the music critic Jean d'Udine advised, "We must reconcile the qualities of the Latin races and those of the North." See his review "Les Grands Concerts," *Courrier musical* (1 Jan. 1902).

22. In his "La jeune musique française," *Figaro musical* (Jan. 1892), Alfred Bruneau also encouraged French composers to do lyric drama, but *à la française*, that is, with clarity and logic (5). As Steven Huebner points out in "Naturalism and Supernaturalism in Alfred Bruneau's *Le Rêve*," *Cambridge Opera Journal* 11, no. 1 (Mar. 1999), Bruneau called his own collaboration with Zola a *drame lyrique* but wanted to depict "lived experience and celebrating its 'real life' and 'humanity'" (81). See also Steven Huebner, *French Opera at the Fin de Siècle: Wagnerism, Nationalism, and Style* (New York, 1999).

23. Borrowing from a postcolonial context and the hybridity characteristic of border cultures, in Bhabha's words from *The Location of Culture*, this would have meant to refigure the past "as a contingent 'in-between' space, that innovates and interrupts the performance of the present" (7).

24. E. Ratez, "Du Nouveau dans l'ancien," *L'Art musical* (31 Mar. 1889): 41.

25. For an excellent study of this perspective, see Michael A. Osborne, *Nature, the Exotic, and the Science of French Colonialism* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1994). As Tzvetan Todorov points out in *On Human Diversity*, if they preferred the term *race* to *species*, it was in order to "avoid offending Christian sensitivities for Christians maintain that all men belong to the same species" (107).

26. Renan, *Histoire*, 501–2.

27. Colonial theorists such as Leroy-Beaulieu, in *De la Colonisation*, defined France's self-image in terms of its influence in the world and saw colonialism as a matter of "life or death": the French must colonize or lose their position in Europe (viii–ix). See also Raoul Girardet, *L'Idée coloniale en France de 1871 à 1962* (Paris: Hachette, 1978), 28.

28. Topinard, in the *Bulletin de la Société d'Anthropologie de Paris* (1881), discussed in Patricia M. E. Lorcin, *Imperial Identities: Stereotyping, Prejudice, and Race in Colonial Algeria* (London: Tauris, 1995), 157–58.

29. Jann Pasler, "The Utility of Musical Instruments in the Racial and Colonial Agendas of Late Nineteenth-Century France," *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 129, no. 1 (Spring 2004): 28–30; Matthew Head, "Musicology on Safari: Orientalism and the Spectre of Postcolonial Theory," *Music Analysis* 22, no. i–ii (2003): 223. See also David Spurr, *The Rhetoric of Empire: Colonial Discourse in Journalism, Travel Writing, and Imperial Administration* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1993), chapter 4; and Bhabha, "The Other Question," in *The Location of Culture*, 66–84.

30. Jann Pasler, "Race and Nation: Musical Acclimatisation and the *Chansons Populaires* in Third Republic France," in *Western Music and Race*, ed. Julie Brown (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2007), 147–67.

31. François-Joseph Fétis, *Histoire générale de la musique depuis les temps les plus anciens jusqu'à nos jours* (Paris: Firmin Didot, 1869). Fétis was a composer, conductor, music critic, and director of the Brussels Conservatory. He also collected many foreign musical instruments that later formed the basis for the Musical Instrument Museum in Brussels.

32. François-Joseph Fétis, "Sur un nouveau mode de classification des races humaines d'après leurs systèmes musicaux," *Bulletin de la Société d'Anthropologie* 2, no. 2 (1867): 137–38.

33. Fétis, "Sur un nouveau mode de classification des races humaines," 138, 140–41.

34. Gobineau, *Essai*, 339. In response to Fétis's lecture, Paul Broca agreed that because music was "one of the first manifestations of human emotions," music had much to teach about human origins (145).

35. Johannes Weber, "Ethnographie des instruments de musique," *Revue et gazette musicale* (16 Nov. 1879 through 29 Feb. 1880). This followed another series of his articles, "Les Types des instruments de musique," *Revue et gazette musicale* (27 Apr. 1879 through 25 May 1879). Weber was a musicologist and music critic who wrote for *Le Temps* (1861–95) and published books on aesthetics and music education in France.

36. Weber, "Ethnographie" (14 Dec. 1879): 401–2.

37. Weber, in "Ethnographie" (11 Jan. 1880), explained this absence of semitones as a result of the Chinese penchant for instrumental over vocal music (9).

38. Weber, "Ethnographie" (1 Feb. 1880): 33.

39. Gobineau, *Essai*, 337; F.-J. Fétis, *Biographie universelle des musiciens*, cited in Jean-Baptiste Weckerlin, *La Chanson populaire* (Paris: Firmin Didot, 1886), 188.

40. Cited in Fauser, *Musical Encounters*, 153.

41. Renan, *Histoire*, believed "inferior races" to be "absolutely incapable of organization and progress" (502). Le Bon, in *The Psychology of Peoples*, attributed to the "primitive and inferior" races a "greater or lesser incapacity to reason" (28).

42. Weber, "Ethnographie" (16 Nov. 1879): 372; and (14 Dec. 1879): 401.

43. Weber, "Ethnographie" (23 Nov. 1879): 377.

44. See note 41.

45. Looking to history, Gobineau, in *Essai*, argued "that all civilization ensued from the white race, that no society can exist without the cooperation of this race, and that a society is great and brilliant in proportion to how long it preserves the noble group that created it, that which belonged to the species' most illustrious branch" (344–45). The ethnologist Girard de Rialle, in *Mémoire sur l'Asie centrale: son histoire, ses populations* (Paris: Ernest Leroux, 1875), also believed that the Aryan race "epitomized all the progress of humanity" (7). Other music scholars of the period concurred. John Rowbotham began his three-volume study, *A History of Music* (London: Trübner, 1885–87), with the assertion: "The history of savage races is a history of arrested developments" (1).

46. Julien Tiersot, *Histoire de la chanson populaire en France* (Paris: Plon, 1889), 348. This book won the Prix Bordin from the Institut for the best comprehensive study of the genre in France.

47. Julien Tiersot, *Mélodies populaires des provinces de France* 3 (Paris: Heugel, 1911), 3.

48. Richard Wallaschek, in *Primitive Music* (1893; New York: Da Capo, 1970), too writes of finding harmony—singing in different parts, intervals, and with accompaniment—in several primitive cultures, including the Hottentots and Maoris. He thus concludes that it should not be considered the "invention of modern times" nor "confined to European races." Since "even uncivilized races know how to accompany a simple song by ear while some of the more civilised ones, such as the Chinese and other Oriental people, do not understand our harmony . . . the difference between people with and without harmonic music is not *a historical but a racial one*" (139–44). The contradictory nature of these statements seemed to have escaped Wallaschek.

49. Julien Tiersot, "Promenades musicales à l'Exposition," *Ménestrel* (6 Oct. 1889): 316, (13 Oct. 1889): 324–26, and (20 Oct. 1889): 332. Annegret Fauser, in *Musical Encounters* also underlines the importance of Tiersot's conclusions (251–52).

50. Most nineteenth-century French writers, however, were not ready to suggest that culture (even European culture) can influence nature (that is, the nature of races, especially those perceived to be inferior) to any significant degree. See Todorov, *On Human Diversity*, for the implications of this "inversion of perspective" (93).

51. Broca, discussant, following Fétis, "Sur un nouveau mode de classification des races humaines," 145.

52. Gobineau, *Essai*, 284.

53. Spurr, *The Rhetoric of Empire*, 34.

54. For example, the Aryans traveled westward from central Asia; the Celts moved eastward as far as Austria.

55. Gobineau, *Essai*, 277, 1060.

56. Gobineau, *Essai*, 242–47, 342–43, 478, 1362–63. As the editor, Jean Boissel, points out, when it came to the "incapacity" of blacks, Gobineau was repeating what others had written. Interestingly, however, Madame de Gobineau was a "créole" from Martinique (1239–41). Gobineau saw the Greeks as a mixture of Aryans, Semitic peoples, "Slavo-Celtic populations saturated with yellow elements," and "black Chamites" (665).

57. Renan, *La Réforme intellectuelle et morale* (1871), cited in Robert Young, *Colonialist Desire: Hybridity in Theory, Culture, and Race* (New York: Routledge, 1995), 68. The first author to use the word *miscegenation* in 1864 saw the United States as an example of how a people could increase their fertility and vigor and form a new super race through racial intermarriage (144).

58. Weber, "Ethnographie" (8 Feb. 1880): 42.

59. For an extended discussion of these issues, see my "The Utility of Musical Instruments."

60. Gobineau, *Essai*, 281–82.

61. M. Gaussin, discussant, following Fétis, "Sur un nouveau mode de classification des races humaines," 144.

62. Julien Tiersot, *Les Types mélodiques dans la chanson populaire française* (Paris: Sagot, 1894), 29–30.

63. Tiersot, *Les Types mélodiques*, 28.

64. Isidore Geoffroy Saint-Hilaire, *Acclimatation et domestication des animaux utiles* (Paris: Maison rustique, 1861). The French first began to experiment with trying to acclimatize species foreign to France in 1848. Declaring that only half the globe had been developed for useful exploitation, in 1855 Saint-Hilaire created a zoo (distinct from the Jardin des plantes) that specialized in acclimatization as well as the creation of racial hybrids: the Jardin zoologique d'acclimatation. See also Osborne, *Nature, the Exotic, and the Science of French Colonialism*.

65. Julien Tiersot, *Notes d'ethnographie musicale* (Paris: Fischbacher, 1905), 129–30.

66. Young, in *Colonial Desire*, links this to its history, which "equated migration with colonization" (178). See also Leroy-Beaulieu, in *De la Colonisation*, and note 3 above.

67. Bourgault-Ducouday, *Trente Mélodies*, 14–16, and "La Musique primitive conservée par les montagnes," *Annuaire du Club alpine française* (1884): 9. In *Trente Mélodies*, he offers an analogously racial hypothesis about the chromatic oriental scale as belonging to Arabs and people whom they've dominated. He found it in *musique populaire*

throughout Turkey, southern Russia, and southern Spain, but "never in countries where the Indo-European element has existed without mixture" (16n1).

68. Gobineau, *Essai*, 283.

69. Jean-Marie Antoine de Lanessan, *Principes de colonisation* (1897), cited in Todorov, *On Human Diversity*, 257.

70. Alfred Rambaud, *La France coloniale* (Paris: Armand Colin, 1895), 107–8.

71. Rambaud, *La France coloniale*, 70–71. As early as 1860 Paul Broca also wrote on blond Kabyles.

72. Leroy-Beaulieu, *De la Colonisation*, 404–5, and Lorcin, *Imperial Identities*, 23, 156–60.

73. Paul Bert, *Lettres de Kabylie* (Paris: Alphonse Lemerre, 1885), 34, and Lorcin, *Imperial Identities*, 189–90.

74. Salvador Daniel, *La Musique arabe* (Alger: Adolphe Jourdan, 1879), 20.

75. Paul Lacome, "Les Chants de la race cabirique ou gallique d'après Salvador Daniel," *Revue et gazette musicale* (5 Dec. 1888): 387. In "Notice sur la musique kabyle," appended to *La Musique arabe*, Daniel notes that, unlike Arab music, Kayble music contains no quarter tones or tones divided into thirds. He also located another mode in it that resembled the Greek Lydian without its second note (161–62). Later, in a footnote to a chapter on Arabic music in his *Notes d'ethnographie musicale*, Tiersot dismisses Daniel's work, particularly his transcriptions of Arab and Kablye songs, but is even more critical of Fétis's work on this repertoire (105–6, 112).

76. Gobineau, *Essai*, 791.

77. Daniel died before he could expand on these claims, although in late fall 1880 the composer-critic Paul Lacome published his notes posthumously, interspersed with critical commentary. See note 75. The timing could not have been better, with Jules Ferry coming to power that September. Despite the 1871 Kabyle insurrection that threw into question the project of Kabyle assimilation, Ferry, a friend of Masqueray, was ready to take it on. Believing, like Bert, that "the solution to the Arab problem is in the schools," the following year he created eight Kabyle schools, the success of which was later attributed to "innate Kabyle ability." See Bert, *Lettres de Kabylie*, 62; Lorcin, *Imperial Identities*, 190–91.

78. Jules Michelet, *Histoire de France* (Paris: Lacroix, 1876); Gilles Deleuze and Félix Guattari, *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia*, trans. Brian Massumi (1980; London: Athone, 1988). Henri Martin, in *Histoire de France* (1844; Paris: Furne, Jouvet, 1874), writes, "It is not chance that the blood of all the races of antiquity mixed in the Gallic blood, that the slow formation of the French people on the Gallic soil is placed at the center of Europe," which he attributes to Providence (ix). In *Etudes d'archéologie celtique* (Paris: Didier, 1872), Martin explicitly compared the Gauls to the Greeks from this perspective (18). Analogously, in music, Bourgault-Ducoudray, in his *Conférence sur la modalité dans la musique grecque* (Paris: Imprimerie nationale, 1879), pointed out that the Western minor mode is a "hybrid" of the diatonic and the chromatic, just as were many Greek modes (47).

79. Eugen Weber, "Gauls versus Franks: Conflict and Nationalism," in *Nationhood and Nationalism in France*, ed. Robert Tombs (New York: HarperCollins, 1991), 15. Many of

the sources I cite here examined what each successive invader contributed to the French character. An excellent summary of the debates over when and with which people the history of France began can be found in Krzysztof Pomian, "Francs et Gaulois," in *Les Lieux de mémoire III. Les France I. Conflits et partages* (Paris: Gallimard, 1992), 41–105.

80. Gobineau, in his *Essai* (1853), too wrote about the "antagonisms and mixtures of hybrid forces" in various races. He had concluded that the white race was an "agglomeration métisse," with, nevertheless, "specific distinctive traits." But, as he saw it, "successive invasions, commerce, colonies, peace and war" had led to "disorder," as "the most distant and different races furnished their contingent of blood to the inhabitants of our great cities" (281–84, 345, 813).

81. Gobineau, *Essai*, 1163.

82. Broca, *Hybridity in the Genus Homo*, 21–22. See also Young, *Colonial Desire*, 18; Schiller, *Broca*, 137, 324.

83. Broca, *Hybridity in the Genus Homo*, 16–18, 25–28.

84. Both of the Prix de Rome libretti focus on Atala's rescue and liberation of Chactas, taken prisoner in an intertribal conflict. They fall in love but, even if he agrees to convert, she resists marriage because of her previous commitment "to die the wife of God."

85. If Chateaubriand begins his prologue by setting up a binary opposition between European and Indian cultures, it is to undermine this subsequently, as Claudia Moscovici argues, by showing how both characters "selectively incorporate and reject elements of both cultures." "Hybridity and Ethics in Chateaubriand's *Atala*," *Nineteenth-Century French Studies* 29, nos. 3–4 (2001): 197–216, especially note 29. Ultimately, as Todorov points out in *On Human Diversity*, "the proper opposition is not between us and the others, but between vice and virtue," that is, "the virtues of individual count for more than the countries to which they belong" (282–308, especially 290–91).

86. Renan, *Histoire*, 501–3.

87. Similarly, in *La Musique*, Lavignac defines the beautiful in music as "residing in the felicitous harmony of proportions" (441).

88. Fouillé, "Dégénérescence?" especially 800, 804, 812–13, and Martin, *Histoire de France*, ix.

89. Henri Lavoix *fils*, *La Musique française* (Paris: Picard, 1891), 15–16, 31–34.

90. Marmontel, *Eléments d'esthétique musicale*, 418–20.

91. As Kerry Murphy points out in "Race and Identity: Appraisals in France of Meyerbeer on his 1891 Centenary," *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 1, no. 2 (2004), in 1865 one critic suggested that "France created his talent and revealed Meyerbeer to himself." In the 1890s, however, his Jewishness increasingly affected his reception. By 1921, Pierre Lasserre referred to him as a "cosmopolitan manipulator" far more than an "artist of blood and race" (33, 42).

92. For more on these concepts, see my *Music as Public Utility* (University of California, forthcoming).

93. Julien Tiersot, *Mélodies populaires des provinces de France* 1 (Paris: Heugel, 1888), 1; and 4 (1911), 3. See also my "Race and Nation," 156–58.

94. Bourgault-Ducoudray, *Conférence*, 47–48.

95. "Les Chants de la race cabirique ou gallique," 387.

96. Henri Quittard, "L'Orientalisme musical. Saint-Saëns orientaliste," *Revue musicale* (1 Mar. 1906), 113.

97. Locke considers the "Rhapsodie mauresque" the "most artistically successful evocation" of "non-Western music-making before Colin McPhee's gamelan-inspired *Tabuh-Tabuhan* (1936)." See his "Cutthroats and Casbah Dancers, Muezzins and Timeless Sands: Musical Images of the Middle East," *Nineteenth-Century Music* (Summer 1998): 41.

98. Quittard, "L'Orientalisme musical," 107, 111–12.

99. Bhabha, *The Location of Culture*, 4.

100. Quittard, in "L'Orientalisme musical," notes that attempts to incorporate Oriental melodies end up in distortion, and this problem is "insurmountable" (108–9).

101. Fouillé, "Dégénérescence?" 793; Max Nordau, *Dégénérescence* (Paris: Alcan, 1894).

102. Martin, *Histoire de France*, 88–90, 132–33.

103. Such a concern perhaps brought Wagner and Gobineau together. The two met in 1876, and Wagner enthusiastically read Gobineau's work in 1880; Gobineau attended *The Ring* in 1881 and 1882. One of Wagner's disciples helped publish Gobineau's work posthumously in the 1890s, after which it became increasingly popular. Gobineau, *Oeuvres* 1, xv–xvi.

104. Armand de Quatrefages, "Acclimatation des animaux et des plantes," *Le Magasin pittoresque* (1883): 373–75. He was a professor of the anatomy and natural history of man.

105. Debussy, *S.I.M.* (15 Jan. 1913), reproduced in *Monsieur Croche*, 220.

106. Jules Ruelle, "*Lohengrin*," *Art Musical* (30 Sept. 1891).

107. Marmontel, *Eléments d'une esthétique musicale*, 425. Later Debussy likewise called for French composers to admire without imitating, to work "après," not "d'après," Wagner.

108. For Fouillé, in "Dégénérescence?" the "question of race was intimately tied to that of the population" (816). No mention of Jews or Jewish immigrants here suggests that they did not dominate discussions about race, as musicologists such as Jane Fulcher have recently inferred. Instead, echoing Debussy's feelings about the influence of Franck, noted above, Fouillé was disturbed by the influx of Belgians, above all, as they constituted more than half of all immigrants, followed by Italians (813, 813n1). The archaeologist Alexandre Bertrand, in *La Gaule avant les Gaulois d'après les monuments et les textes* (Paris: Ernest Leroux, 1884), distinguished the original Belgians from the Celts because their ancestors practiced different funeral rites (9). In music, this was all very ironic since Belgians such as Franck assimilated well into French culture and since Brussel's Théâtre de la Monnaie premiered many French operas at the fin de siècle.

109. Young, *Colonial Desire*, 18.

110. European descendents in Algeria became naturalized French in 1889. See Faidherbe and Topinard, "Instructions sur l'Anthropologie de l'Algérie," *Bulletin de la Société de l'Anthropologie de Paris*, 8 (1873), 603–59, discussed in Lorcin, *Imperial Identities*, 157, 196–97, 202, 209–10. In *De la Colonisation*, Leroy-Beaulieu also mentions other Europeans in Algeria as "useful auxiliaries" as well as those most capable of assimilating with the French (330–31, 336). This was based on the idea that racial mixing was inevitable and some mixed races were great ones.

111. Bert, *Lettres de Kabylie*, 6.

112. Lorcin, *Imperial Identities*, 200. Ernest Reyer's opera *Salammbô* premiered in Paris in 1892, focusing French attention as well on this.

113. In Cairo, where it would have been a "true miracle to see a turban" in local theaters, the audience for Verdi's *Aida* (1871) was also Europeans. See the review by F. Filippi, excerpted in Arthur Pougin, *Verdi* (Paris: Calmann Lévy, 1886), 227.

114. "Palestrina, Pergolese, Handel, Bach, Haydn, Beethoven, etc." were listed as their repertoire in *Revue et gazette musicale* (14 Apr. 1878): 116.

115. Lorcin, *Imperial Identities*, 205.

116. Young, *Colonial Desire*, 18–19.

117. Tiersot, *Mélodies populaires* 1, 1.

118. Daniel, *La Musique arabe*, 58.

119. Weber, "Ethnographie" (8 Feb. 1880): 41–42.

120. Amédée Thierry, *Histoire des Gaulois*, vol. 2 (Paris: Didier, 1859), 551–52; Martin, *Histoire de France*, 1.

121. Tiersot, *Histoire de la chanson populaire*, 170; Martin, *Histoire de France*, 60.

122. Pomian, "Francs et Gaulois," 75.

123. See, for example, Pierre Vaisse, "Les Gaulois dans la peinture officielle," in *Nos Ancêtres les Gaulois*, ed. Paul Viallaneix and Jean Ehrard (Clermont-Ferrand, 1982), 321, 324.

124. Comte de Gobineau, *Amadis*, poëme [sic] (Paris Plon, 1887), and M. H. T. (Marie de la Tour, his longtime mistress), "Preface," xx–xxii, xxxiii. The author wrote book 1 in 1868–69, publishing it in 1876; he wrote books 2 and 3 from 1878 to 1880.

125. Edouard Adénis's libretto for the 1892 Prix de Rome competition makes allusions to *Parsifal* in centering the narrative on the conflict between a magician who promises all worldly desires, including palaces and slaves, to possess the woman of his dreams, and Amadis, who resists his power, in this case to save his beloved.

126. Broca, in his study of the Celts, also believed the Celts preexisted the Gauls and tried to differentiate the French Celts from other Celts. In doing so, he came upon four categories of Celts: the historical Celts (whom Caesar found in some of Gaul) with their different customs and language; the linguistic Celts who, in Western Europe, continued to speak Celtic languages; the much older archaeological Celts, probably from closer to Asia, who brought the Bronze Age to Europe; and the cranial Celts, who had

a certain kind of skull. See Francis Schiller, *Paul Broca: Founder of French Anthropology* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1979), 144–48, and Martin, *Histoire de France*, 4–5.

127. Bertrand, *La Gaule avant les Gaulois*, 7–8, 14, 195–98, 203–4.

128. Tiersot, *Histoire de la chanson populaire*, 170.

129. See also Girard de Rialle, *Les Peuples de l'Asie et de l'Europe* (Paris: Germer Baillière, 1881), 104–5, 167–68. Gobineau, in *Essai*, also believed the Aryans were already distinct from the Celts before the former arrived in India (481).

130. See Bourgault-Ducoudray, "La Musique primitive," 4–5, 9; Tiersot, *Histoire de la chanson populaire*, 187; and Gaston Paris, *La Poésie au moyen age* (Paris: Hachette, 1885), 48.

131. Huebner, *French Opera*, 324–26.

132. Fouillé, "Dégénérescence?" 798.

133. Gobineau, *Essai*, 795; "Les dialects celtiques faisaient tant de résistance à se laisser assimiler aux langues arianes, que plusieurs érudits crurent même pouvoir les dire de source différente" (813).

134. On differences between the Gauls and the Franks, see Martin, *Histoire de France*, 133–35, 208–11.

135. His *Histoire des institutions politiques de l'ancienne France* first appeared in 1877, just as republicans were consolidating their power to take over the majority. In chapters 11–14, he argues against the Frankish "enslavement of the conquered Gauls." See Weber, "Gauls versus Franks," 12.

136. Tiersot, "Preface," in Vincent d'Indy and Julien Tiersot, *Chansons populaires du Vivarais et du Vercors* (Paris: Heugel, 1892), 2. As Martin Stokes has suggested in the Introduction to *Ethnicity, Identity, and Music*, ed. Martin Stokes (Providence, RI: Berg, 1994), the mythology of an authentic Celtic music continues to function as a "discursive trope of great persuasive power" (7).

137. In ancient Greece, he pointed out in his *Conférence*, philosophers believed that this mode inspired "a cult of strength and the feeling of duty" (21). Bourgault-Ducoudray, *Trente Mélodies* and "La Musique primitive," 4–5, 9.

138. Bourgault-Ducoudray, "La Musique primitive," 8; Julien Tiersot, *Chansons populaires recueillies dans les Alpes françaises* (Grenoble: Falque et Perrin, 1903), 500–501.

139. Bourgault-Ducoudray, "La Musique primitive," 5.

140. D'Indy included Palestrina and his generation as among the "primitives."

141. Vincent d'Indy, *Chansons populaires du Vivarais* (Paris: Durand, 1900), ii, 2, 15–17. I develop these arguments in "Race and Nation," 155–67. For more on early music's importance for d'Indy, see Catrina Flint de Médicis, "Nationalism and Early Music at the French Fin-de-Siècle: Three Case Studies," *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 1, no. 2 (2004): 43–66, and my "Deconstructing d'Indy, or the Problem of a Composer's Reputation," *Nineteenth-Century Music* 30, no. 3 (Spring 2007): 252–54.

142. Gobineau devotes chapter 4 of his *Essai* to this question. He believed that when a race was too mixed, it would degenerate and find it impossible to harmonize, or tend toward a "necessary homogeneity," and to arrive at "a common logic, instincts, and common interests, the only reason for social ties" (345).

143. Gobineau, who inherited a fortune from his legitimist uncle, made his politics clear in *La Troisième République française et ce qu'elle vaut* (Strassburg: Trübner, 1907), published posthumously.

144. Republicans took over the Chambre des députés in 1876, and finally the Senate and the presidency in 1879. Gobineau, *Amadis*, 553–56, and M. H. T., "Preface," xxxviii. Léon Bloy saw *Amadis* as not only an attack on bourgeois and republicans, but also a kind of "Darwinism," with all people other than Amadis and his friends condemned to disappear. Léon Bloy, letter of 23 Sept. 1880 to Gobineau, cited in Jean Gaulmier, "Introduction" to Gobineau, *Oeuvres* 1, xxxi. Gobineau's *Essai* ends similarly with the admission that "the white species [*espèce*], considered abstractly, has disappeared from the face of the world" (1163). For the connection to Wagner, see note 103. Some Wagnerian scholars have also seen *Parsifal*, written from 1877–81, that is, at the same time as books 2 and 3 of *Amadis*, as concerning "racial purity" more than theological purity. See the discussion in Walter Frisch, *German Modernism* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2005), 29.

145. Tiersot, "Preface," 32, 39.

146. Bourgault-Ducoudray, *Trente Mélodies*, 11.

147. Tiersot, "Preface," 3.

148. Tiersot, *Chansons populaires recueillies dans les Alpes françaises*, xxv.

149. An American anthropologist who did comparative hearing tests on a wide range of peoples at the Louisiana Purchase Exhibition in 1904, Frank Bruner concurred with nineteenth-century explorers that whites were superior "over all other races both in the keenness and in the range of the hearing sense." In *The Hearing of Primitive Peoples* (New York: Science Press, 1908), he noted that his test results may have been attributable to the fact that interviewees had to interpret the stimuli presented to the ears and therefore some differences may have been attributable to "differences in mental alertness obtained among the different races." Interestingly, however, the greatest differences came between whites and Filipinos, with African negroes, some of them pygmies, very close to whites, and better than whites in their left-ear perceptions (107, 111–12).

150. Léon Pillaut, "Section II, Arts libéraux, 4: Musique," *Exposition internationale de 1889: Catalogue general officiel* (Lille: 1889), 74. See also Pasler, "The Utility of Musical Instruments," 36–37.

151. Marmontel, *Eléments d'esthétique musicale*, 421.

152. Review of the Rome premiere of *Mignon* in *Ménestrel* (3 Nov. 1872): 397. The notion of "science rentrée" comes from Ernest Reyer, cited in Marie-Hélène Coudroy-Saghaï and Hervé Lacombe, "*Faust* et *Mignon* face à la presse," in *Sillages musicologiques*, ed. Philippe Blay and Raphaëlle Legrand (Paris: Conservatoire National de Paris, 1997), 103.

153. Not only the Swede Christine Nilsson and the American Marie Van Zandt, but also the Canadian Emma Albani and the Viennese Pauline Lucca popularized *Mignon*

abroad. In Albani's Covent Garden performance, the reviewer heard "nothing more pure nor more perfect," her "Connais-tu le pays" performed with a "concentrated emotion immediately communicated to the audience." De Retz, "Saison de Londres," *Ménestrel* (5 July 1874): 244. See also reviews in *Ménestrel* (5 Oct. 1873): 358, and (8 Aug. 1880): 287.

154. For further discussion of these ideas, see my *Music as Public Utility*.

155. Renan, *La Réforme intellectuelle et morale*, 123–24.

156. In *Journal de musique*, see "Nouvelles de Partout" (4 Nov. 1876): 4, "Le Prix de 10,000 francs" (11 Nov. 1876): 1, and "Un rapport de M. de Chennevières" (25 Jan. 1879): 3–4.

157. Ernest Reyer, "Revue musicale," *Le Journal des débats* (27 Sept. 1873).

158. In contrast to this alliance of the pure with the abstract in Western classical music, Wallaschek, in *Primitive Music*, argued that the oldest music in primitive cultures was specifically not abstract nor a luxury, but rather "part of the necessities of life (war and hunting)" and "an organizing power for the masses, the tie which enables the tribe to act as one body" (294–95).

159. Renan, *Histoire générale des langues sémitiques*, 504.

160. *Ménestrel* (17 Mar. 1872): 123.

161. Debussy, *L'Intransigeant*, 259–60.

162. Taking on the eminent historian Fustel de Coulanges, Fouillé observed in "Dégénérescence?" that "The Franks and Germans neither regenerated nor truly transformed Gaul. They were as corrupt as the Romans, even more" (810).

163. Debussy, "Lettre-préface à 'Pour la musique française douze causeries' " (1917), reproduced in *Monsieur Croche*, 262.

164. Etienne Balibar, "Is there a 'Neo-Racism'?" in Balibar and Immanuel Wallerstein, *Race, Nation, Class: Ambiguous Identities*, trans. Chris Turner (New York: Verso, 1992), writes of this as "a racism whose dominant theme is not biological heredity but the insurmountability of cultural differences, a racism which, at first sight, does not postulate the superiority of certain groups or peoples in relation to others but 'only' the harmfulness of abolishing frontiers, the incompatibility of lifestyles and traditions" (21).

165. Maurice Fleuret, Fête de la musique, video press conference (1 June 1982).

166. "25 années de Fête de la musique: un bref historique," *25e Fête de la musique: Dossier de presse* (Paris: Fnac, 2006), 3, 8.